

1 ROB BONTA  
 Attorney General of California  
 2 ANYA M. BINSACCA  
 Supervising Deputy Attorney General  
 3 SHIWON CHOE  
 Deputy Attorney General  
 4 State Bar No. 320041  
 455 Golden Gate Avenue, Suite 11000  
 5 San Francisco, CA 94102-7004  
 Telephone: (415) 510-4400  
 6 Fax: (415) 703-5480  
 E-mail: Shiwon.Cho@doj.ca.gov  
 7 *Attorneys for Defendant Rob Bonta, in his official  
 capacity as Attorney General of California*

8  
 9 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 10 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 11 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

13 **FIRST AMENDMENT COALITION, et al.,**

14 Plaintiffs,

15 v.

17 **DAVID CHIU, et al.,**

18 Defendants.

Case No. 3:24-cv-08343-RFL

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~  
 ORDER FOR ENTRY OF  
 PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION AND TO  
 EXTEND TIME FOR DEFENDANTS TO  
 RESPOND TO COMPLAINT**

Date/Time: January 14, 2025 at 10:00 a.m.  
 Location: Courtroom 15, 18th Floor

19  
 20  
 21  
 22  
 23  
 24  
 25  
 26  
 27  
 28

1 Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 6-1 and 7-12, the Parties, through their counsel of record, enter  
2 into the following stipulation.

3 **STIPULATION**

4 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs filed their Complaint on November 22, 2024 (Dkt. No. 1);

5 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs filed a Motion for a Preliminary Injunction on November 25, 2024  
6 (Dkt. No. 11-3), and re-noticed the Motion on December 11, 2024 (Dkt. No. 29);

7 WHEREAS, the Parties agree to resolve the Motion without the time, expense, and  
8 uncertainty associated with further litigation of the Motion;

9 THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY AGREED AND STIPULATED, subject to the Court's  
10 approval and order, that:

- 11 1. Defendants, and all their officers, agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and other  
12 persons in active concert or participation with them, are preliminarily enjoined from  
13 enforcing California Penal Code § 851.92(c) against the dissemination by any  
14 person or entity of (a) information relating to any arrest report that the person or  
15 entity reasonably believes was obtained from the government through a public  
16 records request; or (b) information that is or has been at any time otherwise made  
17 publicly available and relates to any arrest report, including (but not limited to) the  
18 arrest report at issue in this case (described in the Complaint (Dkt. No. 1) at ¶¶ 41,  
19 47, 54–56, 63) and the contents thereof.
- 20 2. This stipulation resolves, subject to the rights reserved in paragraph (4), Plaintiffs'  
21 Motion for a Preliminary Injunction, and the January 14, 2025 hearing on the  
22 Motion is taken off calendar.
- 23 3. This stipulation is limited to California Penal Code § 851.92(c) and does not affect  
24 Defendants' right or ability to enforce any other law or provision.
- 25 4. This stipulation is without prejudice to any position that any party may take in the  
26 remainder of this case, including without limitation (a) Plaintiffs' seeking  
27 preliminary injunctive relief (beyond the scope of the relief the Court orders as a  
28 result of this stipulation) or permanent injunctive relief or (b) Defendants' arguing

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

that no further preliminary injunctive relief and no permanent injunctive relief are warranted.

5. The time for Defendants to respond to Plaintiffs’ Complaint is extended to February 14, 2025.

Dated: December 16, 2024

Respectfully submitted,

FOUNDATION FOR INDIVIDUAL RIGHTS & EXPRESSION

s/Adam Steinbaugh\*  
ADAM STEINBAUGH  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

DAVID CHIU  
City Attorney  
YVONNE R. MERÉ  
TARA M. STEELEY  
Deputy City Attorneys

s/Kaitlyn Murphy\*  
KAITLYN MURPHY  
Deputy City Attorney  
*Attorneys for Defendant David Chiu, in his official capacity as City Attorney for the City and County of San Francisco*

ROB BONTA  
Attorney General of California  
ANYA M. BINSACCA  
Supervising Deputy Attorney General

s/Shiwon Choe  
SHIWON CHOE  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Attorneys for Defendant Rob Bonta, in his official capacity as California Attorney General*

\* In accordance with Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), the filer attests that all signatories have concurred in the filing of this document.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER

The Court, having reviewed and fully considered the parties' stipulation, **ORDERS** the preliminary injunction and conditions to which the parties have stipulated.

Dated: December 19, 2024

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
THE HON. RITA F. LIN  
*United States District Judge*