

1 ANGÉLICA SALCEDA, Cal. Bar No. 296152
SHAYLA HARRIS, Cal. Bar No. 354010
2 AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA, INC.
3 39 Drumm Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
4 Telephone: 415.621.2493
Facsimile: 415.255.1478
5 Email: asalceda@aclunc.org
sharris@aclunc.org
6

7 Attorneys for Petitioner AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES
UNION OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA

8 DAVID LOY, Cal. Bar No. 229235
9 ANN CAPPETTA, Cal. Bar No. 354079
FIRST AMENDMENT COALITION
10 534 4th Street, Suite B
San Rafael, CA 94901-3334
11 Telephone: 415.460.5060
Email: dloy@firstamendmentcoalition.org
12 acappetta@firstamendmentcoalition.org

E-FILED
6/10/2024 3:09 PM
Superior Court of California
County of Fresno
By: Hannah Garcia, Deputy

13 Attorneys for Petitioner FIRST AMENDMENT COALITION

14
15 **SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**
16 **FOR THE COUNTY OF FRESNO**

17 AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION OF
18 NORTHERN CALIFORNIA, a nonprofit
corporation, and FIRST AMENDMENT
19 COALITION, a nonprofit corporation,

20 Petitioners,

21 v.

22 THE CITY OF FRESNO, and THE HONORABLE
MEMBERS OF THE FRESNO CITY COUNCIL,

23 Respondents.
24
25
26
27
28

CASE NO. 23CECG04744

**DECLARATION OF SONYA
LEDANSKI HYDE IN SUPPORT
OF MOTION FOR JUDGMENT**

Date: August 28, 2024

Time: 1:30 p.m.

Dept.: 404

Judge: Hon. Robert Whalen

Petition Filed: November 15, 2023

1 I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, declare:

2 1. I am a certified transcriptionist and work with Veritext. I have personal knowledge
3 of the facts set forth in this Declaration and, if called upon, could testify to those facts.

4 2. On or around November 3, 2023, I received a request from Veritext to transcribe
5 portions of a series of video recordings of Fresno City Council meetings. Veritext provided
6 me with the Granicus link to each video and with the timestamp of the portion of the video
7 that I was assigned to transcribe.

8 3. On or around November 16, 2023, I completed the transcriptions of the following
9 portions of video recordings of the following Fresno City Council meetings: June 21, 2018
10 (04:10:01 to 04:26:55);¹ November 29, 2018 (02:08:20 to 02:16:48);² March 7, 2019
11 (00:54:45 to 00:56:50);³ February 10, 2022 (05:50:54 to 06:02:08);⁴ June 5, 2023 (00:39:07 to
12 01:01:35);⁵ and June 14, 2023 (01:00:42 to 01:03:53).⁶

13 4. Each transcription is a true, correct, and accurate transcript of the listed portions of
14 the foregoing recordings of Fresno City Council meetings on the dates set forth above.

15 5. Attached hereto as Exhibit AA is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
16 listed portion of the video recording of the June 21, 2018 Fresno City Council meeting.

17 6. Attached hereto as Exhibit BB is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
18 listed portion of the video recording of the November 29, 2018 Fresno City Council meeting.

19 7. Attached hereto as Exhibit CC is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
20 listed portion of the video recording of the March 7, 2019 Fresno City Council meeting.

21 8. Attached hereto as Exhibit DD is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
22 listed portion of the video recording of the February 10, 2022 Fresno City Council meeting.

23 9. Attached hereto as Exhibit EE is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the
24 listed portion of the video recording of the June 5, 2023 Fresno City Council meeting.

25 ¹ https://fresno.granicus.com/player/clip/509?meta_id=174738

26 ² https://fresno.granicus.com/player/clip/578?meta_id=200841

27 ³ https://fresno.granicus.com/player/clip/610?meta_id=218329

28 ⁴ https://fresno.granicus.com/player/clip/1052?meta_id=371259

⁵ https://fresno.granicus.com/player/clip/1443?meta_id=443958

⁶ https://fresno.granicus.com/player/clip/1450?meta_id=448283

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

10. Attached hereto as Exhibit FF is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the listed portion of the video recording of the June 14, 2023 Fresno City Council meeting.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

Executed this 22nd day of April 2024, in the State of New York.


Sonya Ledanski Hyde
Veritext

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

PROOF OF SERVICE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF MARIN

At the time of service, I was over 18 years of age and not a party to this action. I am employed in the County of Marin, State of California. My business address is 534 4th Street, Suite B, San Rafael, CA 94901-3334.

On June 10, 2024, I served true copies of the following document(s) described as **DECLARATION OF SONYA LEDANSKI HYDE IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR JUDGMENT** on the interested parties in this action as follows:

Anthony R. Taylor
Michael R. Linden
3880 Lemon Street, Suite 520
Riverside, CA 92501
Email: ataylor@awattorneys.com; mlinden@awattorneys.com

BY E-MAIL OR ELECTRONIC TRANSMISSION: Based on an agreement of the parties to accept service by e-mail or electronic transmission I caused a copy of the document(s) to be sent from e-mail address rregnier@firstamendmentcoalition.org to the persons at the e-mail addresses listed in the Service List. I did not receive, within a reasonable time after the transmission, any electronic message or other indication that the transmission was unsuccessful.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on June 10, 2024, at East Palo Alto, California.



Robin P. Regnier

Exhibit AA

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Fresno City Council Meetings
2018.06.21 Motion 15 - Amended to Create
Committee

1 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Next
2 motion, Motion 15, which is motion to move
3 estimated 9.9 million in the August 2009 sales
4 tax into the reserve fund and move the estimated
5 3.5 million general fund reserve revenues across
6 each Council District's infrastructure fund.
7 This motion was made by Councilmember Chavez,
8 seconded by Councilmember Baines.

9 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: Thank you,
10 President Soria. Yeah, I made this motion. I
11 think this would be a good compromise for my
12 colleagues, putting the 9.9 million into the
13 reserve, but I know that there's been some
14 conversations and I know that there was some will
15 of the Council to modify that a bit, so I look to
16 hear what you have to say.

17 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Yes,
18 Councilmember Chavez. So, what I wanted to do --
19 I wanted to take a little bit more time to figure
20 out and have that discussion about the 3.5
21 million, so I'd like to amend your motion to
22 create a subcommittee -- the subcommittee can
23 include yourself, myself and Councilmember
24 Caprioglio -- to meet with the administration,
25 the City Manager and the staff to kind of sort

1 those things out before coming back with a final
2 vote of the budget.

3 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: I'm fine
4 with that.

5 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: The
6 seconder? Great. So, we're amending the motion
7 and Councilmember Baines agrees with that motion.
8 Councilmember Olivier?

9 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: Repeat
10 the amendment to the motion, please?

11 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: So, we're
12 going to hold off in essentially voting on this
13 motion and creating a subcommittee --
14 subcommittee would include Councilmember Chavez,
15 Councilmember Caprioglio, and myself -- to meet
16 with the administration and figure out the 3.5
17 million and the whole 9 million that is
18 outstanding that we've been discussing.
19 Councilmember Bredefeld?

20 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Yeah,
21 I'm unclear -- the subcommittee, the purpose. I
22 mean, why are we just not addressing it out here
23 now? I mean, what are you hoping to gain from
24 having that kind of dialog?

25 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: I think

1 that originally, we had talked about splitting
2 the monies, right, for our own Districts. We
3 already took a motion earlier that passed that
4 we're allocating \$150,000 in terms of
5 infrastructure, so this will give us an
6 opportunity to see if there's other things rather
7 than just going towards our own budgets. So,
8 that's why we're asking for the extra time.
9 Councilmember Olivier?

10 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: Yeah, I
11 just have a quick question. I think we probably
12 have unspent money from -- in our Council
13 budgets, I guess, for somebody. Is there any
14 carryover for Councilmember infrastructure
15 budgets? Is there -- how much are we carrying
16 over that Councilmembers have not spent?

17 MAN 1: I think a total of about --
18 between their Parks UGM and their infrastructure
19 budgets, I think it's about 2 million.

20 MAN 2: Approximately.

21 MAN 1: Yeah, about 2 million.

22 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: Okay.
23 Well, that's a lot of money that we have not
24 spent yet that's --

25 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Which goes

1 to my point to say that we need a little bit
2 additional time to figure out, because we don't
3 know if we're going to do -- if we would move
4 just to allocate an additional half a million,
5 since one, we voted on the additional 150,000 for
6 infrastructure, so that's why we want to be able
7 to further discuss. So, there's a motion on --

8 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: I just
9 have another. If -- so, there's going to be a
10 delegation of three like-minded Councilmembers to
11 go to the administration and ask -- find out what
12 needs money? Like, what needs to be spent on?

13 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: Let me
14 chime in. So, Councilmember Olivier, just for
15 clarification, so the purpose of the subcommittee
16 is to identify specific projects in each Council
17 District that those resources would be allocated.
18 So, you might have different needs in District 7;
19 so would Councilmember Bredefeld. That's the
20 purpose of the subcommittee, to iron that out.
21 The other option is that we just get the 500,000
22 and then each Councilmember respectively just
23 outlines where they would like it spent. I think
24 the more prudent approach would be to actually
25 identify some specific projects, and we have been

1 converse --

2 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: So,
3 does this motion include putting the sales tax
4 accrual in the reserves immediately, and the
5 creation of a committee?

6 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: That's part
7 of the motion.

8 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: So, it
9 is. So, if this passes today --

10 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: When we
11 bring it back.

12 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: Oh, it
13 has to come back.

14 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: Correct.

15 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: But is
16 it the intention of the members of the Committee
17 to try and find a way to allocate some of the
18 sales tax accrual as well?

19 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: I think
20 there's --

21 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: Because
22 I won't be able to support -- I want to find a
23 way to help my colleagues and help support, but
24 I'm not going to be able to do that if the -- I
25 mean, I take you at face value, but I want to

1 know right now: is it part of the subcommittee's
2 intention to try to find a way to spend the sales
3 tax accrual as well? Is that part of it? Is
4 that on the table as well?

5 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: My approach
6 is for the 500,000. That's my approach. I'm one
7 of seven, so -- and if you're not comfortable
8 with it, when it comes back, you can vote no. I
9 mean, that's totally your prerogative.

10 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: Okay.
11 The other thing that I would submit is I know of
12 something -- I think that it's important -- in
13 this form of government, I think it's important
14 to know when to wear your District hat and to
15 know when to wear your citywide hat, and it seems
16 -- I'm just going to wait until everybody comes
17 back to their seats before I continue.

18 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: As part of
19 the budget, can we budget some paper towels for
20 when Councilmembers spill Coca-Cola on their
21 desk, too?

22 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: I think
23 that -- I think I would ask Council -- I think to
24 earn my support, I think we should have a 7-0. I
25 think we should dedicate the sales tax accrual

1 and put it in the reserves, and I think we should
2 take the 3.5 and I think that we should put it --
3 invest it into something that we can all get
4 behind, invest it into something that I heard
5 from this dais a number of times from every
6 single Councilmember who sits up here, and that's
7 the need for a senior citizen's center in the
8 city of Fresno.

9 And I have heard -- and I don't want to
10 put anyone on the spot, but I've heard things
11 like "This is the most important thing we can do
12 for our city. This is the most important thing
13 we can do besides public safety for our city, for
14 the retired citizens of Fresno." I've heard it
15 many times. The Senior Task Force completed six
16 months of work and came forward with a white
17 paper. And then, our Parks Department spent
18 months and months coming up with a business plan.
19 City Council and administration, we are ready.
20 We are ready to deliver on the promises each one
21 of us have made to our seniors.

22 So, is this now -- is this an
23 opportunity for us to say, "You know what, we'll
24 take our District hats off. Yeah, we all need
25 tree trim. Yeah, we all need paving. Yeah, we

1 all need..." -- and deliver on something that
2 we've paid so much -- myself included, we've all
3 paid so much lip service to our senior citizens
4 community in this city and we're so close. So,
5 if we can't compromise; the fire station is not
6 the direction this Council wants to go in, could
7 a senior citizen's center be the direction that
8 the Council wants to go in? And I would hope the
9 answer would be yes.

10 So, I guess my question for the maker
11 of the motion: would you be interested in the
12 3.5 million -- or 2.5 million funds a senior
13 center, I think Parvin was talking, and Sean, for
14 five years. Would the maker of the motion -- and
15 I think he could probably get a 7-0 vote right
16 now to deliver on the promises that we've been
17 making to our seniors. So, would the maker of
18 the motion be willing -- and I think he'd get a
19 7-0 vote by taking that second part of money out
20 of what it says on this piece of paper -- to put
21 money into infrastructure funds and fund a senior
22 center in Fresno for five years? That would be
23 my request, and we would -- I promise we'd get a
24 7-0 vote on that.

25 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: Well, then,

1 maybe you can make a motion on that, but I'd like
2 a vote on my motion first.

3 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Thank you.
4 Councilmember Caprioglio?

5 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: Just
6 clarification -- my offer was to complete the
7 community center in District 4. As we all know,
8 and I've said it a thousand times, that I don't
9 have one. So, I would urge you to join forces
10 with District 4 and make a Clint Olivier Senior
11 Center room or building or annex to a community
12 center in District 4. I'd have to have that
13 before I could support a motion that you're
14 suggesting, because I've never promised that in
15 and of itself as a standalone building.

16 Nothing against seniors, but I have to
17 take care of my children, people of all ages in
18 District 4 before I can isolate and do a
19 standalone for seniors, so that's just what I
20 want you to understand, and I appreciate what
21 you're doing for seniors on this dais. My mom's
22 91 years old. She'd love to get a senior hot
23 meal or hang out at the senior center, but I have
24 to get that community center first, which those
25 people can still enjoy and come and participate

1 once we get it done in District 4, so just for
2 clarification. Just wanted to let you know how I
3 feel about that. Thank you.

4 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Thank you.
5 Councilmember Bredefeld.

6 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Yeah.
7 Again, I asked about the committee. I think I'm
8 not going to support this because I'm not sure
9 this is the best way we should be doing this. I
10 frankly like the idea of using the \$3.5 million
11 for the fire station. I think it ought to be
12 something that benefits the entire city and
13 obviously, public safety is our number one
14 priority and we need that fire station. And in
15 order for the growth area to take place -- and we
16 need the growth -- we've got to have the fire
17 station there as well. That's incumbent upon
18 that to happen.

19 I think when we start getting down to -
20 - breaking down this into seven pots, I think
21 we're going to run into trouble. I think we
22 already have almost \$200,000 that we're going to
23 be able to utilize. There's other monies that
24 aren't being spent that we need to spend for our
25 citizens, so I think we're moving in the wrong

1 direction. That's why I won't support it. And I
2 implore the Council, let's get the fire station
3 that we all know needs to happen.

4 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA:

5 Councilmember Olivier.

6 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: I guess
7 my final -- I would ask Council and even the
8 maker of the motion as well -- I would ask for a
9 no vote, and I would ask that we reset after this
10 vote and that we move forward. If -- I mean, the
11 seniors aren't here today. If the seniors were
12 here today, I think we'd have a different result,
13 but they're not here today, and I wish they were
14 because I think it'd be great to have, you know,
15 75, 80 of them with -- waving signs and demanding
16 that we act. They're the ones that have been
17 paying taxes and working and doing so much for
18 our city for decades and decades.

19 And all due respect, Councilmember
20 Caprioglio, you are a fantastic advocate for a
21 community center in your District. You are doing
22 very, very good work. You don't stop; you're a
23 great advocate for that. But I don't see 85, 100
24 people in here waving signs and demanding a
25 community center in District 4. The seniors --

Page 12

1 if we -- if you and I have to compromise and we
2 put the senior center in your District, I say
3 let's do that, but the seniors come here
4 regularly. And yes, thank you, we all voted
5 \$100,000 for the seniors, but it's not -- Council
6 colleagues, I'm a little disheartened because the
7 mood and the words that we're all choosing as we
8 address the issue of a senior center are
9 different today than they were when this gallery
10 was full of seniors.

11 And so, my request of you is -- and
12 even to the maker of this motion -- I have not
13 seen this gallery full of people demanding that
14 we put hundreds of thousands of dollars in our
15 infrastructure funds, but I have seen this
16 gallery full of senior citizens demanding that we
17 address their needs. And so, I'm saying that
18 maybe -- Member Chavez, you want to vote. I
19 appreciate that. We're going to vote. But I'm
20 saying if it fails, let's come back and let's
21 deliver. There's been a white paper. There's
22 been a task force. Our Parks Department has --
23 it's ready to go, folks. It's ready to go.
24 Let's execute that.

25 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ:

1 Councilmember Olivier, I just want to remind you
2 that the day that the seniors were here, you
3 didn't say anything about making a motion about
4 this. And so, that was the opportunity to make
5 that, and you did not. I had to step in and do
6 that. What's the difference?

7 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: The
8 difference is that \$100,000 does not even begin
9 to address their needs. So, you can grandstand
10 and you can talk about how you came --

11 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: I'm not
12 grandstanding.

13 COUNCILMEMBER CLINTON OLIVIER: No, you
14 put me down and you're grandstanding over
15 \$100,000.

16 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: I actually
17 have the guts to do something.

18 MAN 3: I call for the question.

19 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: I do
20 have a comment.

21 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: We call --

22 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: I
23 punched in. I tried to punch in.

24 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Okay, I'll
25 give you the -- yes, your thing was not working,

1 so I'll give you the last, but we will be taking
2 a vote immediately after your comment.

3 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: Okay.
4 So, I guess my first question is, Councilmember
5 Chavez, what's the motion as it currently stands?
6 Is it originally written, or has it been amended?

7 COUNCILMEMBER LUIS CHAVEZ: It's with
8 the amendment that Councilmember Soria made.

9 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: Please
10 remind me. A committee that's to meet in the
11 next six days or so? Okay. All right, so -- and
12 that's fine, because I'm subject to my
13 colleagues. My concerns are that we'll find
14 ourselves in almost the same type of thing again
15 next week. I'm a little -- I'd rather take votes
16 and then see what does or doesn't work, and then
17 we know -- then when that committee meets, you
18 kind of know -- "That's not going to work."

19 So, I would be -- I'd almost like to
20 vote on your motion today as you presented it,
21 and then somebody make a motion to create the
22 committee, and that could even be the two of you
23 again. And I -- so, I'm not against the
24 committee, but I'd love to -- let's take some
25 votes, see what gets eliminated, like for

1 instance, the fire station, and then we can move
2 on. I want to go all the way back to the 9.9
3 million, and I'm going to say it for all my
4 colleagues: whatever iteration comes out, I'm
5 only going to support a motion that puts the
6 whole 9.9 million in the reserve. And then, the
7 3.5, worthy of debate. Personally, at this
8 point, I would like to see the 9.9 voted on. I
9 made that motion. I don't have to make it again.
10 Somebody else wants to make it, I'd love to get
11 that off the table today, okay? Because then we
12 can start talking cleanly about the 3.5. City
13 Manager, any --

14 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER:
15 We're going to go ahead -- there's a call for the
16 vote, but I would like to -- since Councilmember
17 Brandau asked, so we are supportive of working
18 with the Council, but we are adamant that the 9.9
19 or whatever it ends up being go into the General
20 Fund -- Emergency Reserve Fund.

21 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Thank you.
22 So, we'll call for the question, so we can take
23 an electronic vote. There's a motion and a
24 second to the amend -- and it was amended.
25 Motion carries 4-3.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, certify that the
foregoing transcript is a true and accurate
record of the proceedings.

Date: November 16, 2023

<%12151,Signature%>
Sonya Ledanski Hyde

[1 - chavez]

1	75 12:15	allocate 5:4	brandau 14:19
1 4:17,21	8	6:17	14:22 15:3,9
100 12:23	80 12:15	allocated 5:17	16:17
100,000 13:5	85 12:23	allocating 4:4	breaking 11:20
14:8,15	9	amend 2:21	bredefeld 3:19
12151 17:11	9 3:17	16:24	3:20 5:19 11:5
15 1:13 2:2	9.9 2:3,12 16:2	amended 1:13	11:6
150,000 4:4 5:5	16:6,8,18	15:6 16:24	bring 6:11
16 17:6	91 10:22	amending 3:6	budget 3:2 7:19
2	a	amendment	7:19
2 4:19,20,21	able 5:6 6:22	3:10 15:8	budgets 4:7,13
2.5 9:12	6:24 11:23	annex 10:11	4:15,19
200,000 11:22	accrual 6:4,18	answer 9:9	building 10:11
2009 2:3	7:3,25	appreciate	10:15
2018.06.21 1:13	accurate 17:4	10:20 13:19	business 8:18
2023 17:6	act 12:16	approach 5:24	c
3	actually 5:24	7:5,6	c 17:1,1
3 14:18	14:16	approximately	call 14:18,21
3.5 2:5,20 3:16	adamant 16:18	4:20	16:15,22
8:2 9:12 11:10	additional 5:2	area 11:15	caprioglio 2:24
16:7	5:4,5	aren't 11:24	3:15 10:4,5
3.5. 16:12	address 13:8,17	12:11	12:20
4	14:9	asked 11:7	care 10:17
4 10:7,10,12,18	addressing	16:17	carries 16:25
11:1 12:25	3:22	asking 4:8	carrying 4:15
4-3 16:25	administration	august 2:3	carryover 4:14
5	2:24 3:16 5:11	b	center 8:7 9:7
500,000 5:21	8:19	back 3:1 6:11	9:13,22 10:7
7:6	advocate 12:20	6:13 7:8,17	10:11,12,23,24
7	12:23	13:20 16:2	12:21,25 13:2
7 5:18	ages 10:17	baines 2:8 3:7	13:8
7-0 7:24 9:15	agrees 3:7	benefits 11:12	certify 17:3
9:19,24	ahead 16:15	best 11:9	chavez 2:7,9,18
		bit 2:15,19 5:1	3:3,14 5:13 6:6
			6:10,14 7:5,18

[chavez - emergency]

<p>9:25 13:18,25 14:11,16 15:5 15:7 children 10:17 chime 5:14 choosing 13:7 citizen's 8:7 9:7 citizens 8:14 9:3 11:25 13:16 city 1:12 2:25 8:8,12,13,19 9:4 11:12 12:18 16:12,14 citywide 7:15 clarification 5:15 10:6 11:2 cleanly 16:12 clint 10:10 clinton 3:9 4:10 4:22 5:8 6:2,8 6:12,15,21 7:10,22 12:6 14:7,13 close 9:4 coca 7:20 cola 7:20 colleagues 2:12 6:23 13:6 15:13 16:4 come 6:13 10:25 13:3,20 comes 7:8,16 16:4</p>	<p>comfortable 7:7 coming 3:1 8:18 comment 14:20 15:2 committee 1:14 6:5,16 11:7 15:10,17,22,24 community 9:4 10:7,11,24 12:21,25 complete 10:6 completed 8:15 compromise 2:11 9:5 13:1 concerns 15:13 continue 7:17 conversations 2:14 converse 6:1 correct 6:14 council 1:12 2:6,15 4:12 5:16 7:23 8:19 9:6,8 12:2,7 13:5 16:18 councilmember 2:7,8,9,18,23 3:3,7,8,9,14,15 3:19,20 4:9,10 4:14,22 5:8,13 5:14,19,22 6:2 6:6,8,10,12,14 6:15,21 7:5,10</p>	<p>7:18,22 8:6 9:25 10:4,5 11:5,6 12:5,6 12:19 13:25 14:1,7,11,13,16 15:4,7,8 16:16 councilmemb... 4:16 5:10 7:20 create 1:13 2:22 15:21 creating 3:13 creation 6:5 currently 15:5</p> <p style="text-align: center;">d</p> <p>dais 8:5 10:21 date 17:6 day 14:2 days 15:11 debate 16:7 decades 12:18 12:18 dedicate 7:25 delegation 5:10 deliver 8:20 9:1 9:16 13:21 demanding 12:15,24 13:13 13:16 department 8:17 13:22 desk 7:21 dialog 3:24 didn't 14:3 difference 14:6 14:8</p>	<p>different 5:18 12:12 13:9 direction 9:6,7 12:1 discuss 5:7 discussing 3:18 discussion 2:20 disheartened 13:6 district 5:17,18 7:14 8:24 10:7 10:10,12,18 11:1 12:21,25 13:2 district's 2:6 districts 4:2 doesn't 15:16 doing 10:21 11:9 12:17,21 dollars 13:14 don't 5:2 8:9 10:8 12:22,23 16:9 due 12:19</p> <p style="text-align: center;">e</p> <p>e 17:1 earlier 4:3 earn 7:24 electronic 16:23 eliminated 15:25 emergency 16:20</p>
---	---	--	--

[ends - know]

<p>ends 16:19 enjoy 10:25 entire 11:12 esmeralda 2:1 2:17 3:5,11,25 4:25 6:19 10:3 11:4 12:4 14:21,24 16:21 essentially 3:12 estimated 2:3,4 everybody 7:16 execute 13:24 extra 4:8</p>	<p>forces 10:9 foregoing 17:4 form 7:13 forward 8:16 12:10 frankly 11:10 fresno 1:12 8:8 8:14 9:22 full 13:10,13,16 fund 2:4,5,6 9:21 16:20,20 funds 9:12,21 13:15 further 5:7</p>	<p>government 7:13 grandstand 14:9 grandstanding 14:12,14 great 3:6 12:14 12:23 growth 11:15 11:16 guess 4:13 9:10 12:6 15:4 guts 14:17</p>	<p>identify 5:16 5:25 immediately 6:4 15:2 implore 12:2 important 7:12 7:13 8:11,12 include 2:23 3:14 6:3 included 9:2 incumbent 11:17 infrastructure 2:6 4:5,14,18 5:6 9:21 13:15 instance 16:1 intention 6:16 7:2 interested 9:11 invest 8:3,4 iron 5:20 isolate 10:18 issue 13:8 it'd 12:14 iteration 16:4</p>
f	g	h	j
<p>f 17:1 face 6:25 fails 13:20 fantastic 12:20 feel 11:3 figure 2:19 3:16 5:2 final 3:1 12:7 find 5:11 6:17 6:22 7:2 15:13 fine 3:3 15:12 fire 9:5 11:11 11:14,16 12:2 16:1 first 10:2,24 15:4 five 9:14,22 folks 13:23 force 8:15 13:22</p>	<p>gain 3:23 gallery 13:9,13 13:16 garry 3:20 11:6 general 2:5 16:19 getting 11:19 give 4:5 14:25 15:1 go 5:11 9:6,8 13:23,23 16:2 16:15,19 goes 4:25 going 3:12 4:7 5:3,9 6:24 7:16 11:8,21,22 13:19 15:18 16:3,5,15 good 2:11 12:22</p>	<p>half 5:4 hang 10:23 happen 11:18 12:3 hat 7:14,15 hats 8:24 hear 2:16 heard 8:4,9,10 8:14 help 6:23,23 hold 3:12 hope 9:8 hoping 3:23 hot 10:22 hundreds 13:14 hyde 17:3,12</p>	<p>join 10:9</p>
		i	k
		<p>idea 11:10</p>	<p>kind 2:25 3:24 15:18 know 2:13,14 5:3 7:1,11,14 7:15 8:23 10:7 11:2 12:3,14</p>

[know - prerogative]

15:17,18	meet 2:24 3:15	n	originally 4:1
l	15:10	n 17:1	15:6
ledanski 17:3	meetings 1:12	need 5:1 8:7,24	ought 11:11
17:12	meets 15:17	8:25 9:1 11:14	outlines 5:23
lip 9:3	member 13:18	11:16,24	outstanding
little 2:19 5:1	members 6:16	needs 5:12,12	3:18
13:6 15:15	million 2:3,5,12	5:18 12:3	own 4:2,7
look 2:15	2:21 3:17,17	13:17 14:9	p
lot 4:23	4:19,21 5:4	never 10:14	paid 9:2,3
love 10:22	9:12,12 11:10	november 17:6	paper 7:19 8:17
15:24 16:10	16:3,6	number 8:5	9:20 13:21
luis 2:9 3:3	minded 5:10	11:13	parks 4:18 8:17
5:13 6:6,10,14	modify 2:15	o	13:22
7:5,18 9:25	mom's 10:21	o 17:1	part 6:6 7:1,3
13:25 14:11,16	money 4:12,23	obviously	7:18 9:19
15:7	5:12 9:19,21	11:13	participate
m	monies 4:2	offer 10:6	10:25
made 2:7,10	11:23	oh 6:12	parvin 9:13
8:21 15:8 16:9	months 8:16,18	okay 4:22 7:10	passed 4:3
make 10:1,10	8:18	14:24 15:3,11	passes 6:9
14:4 15:21	mood 13:7	16:11	paul 10:5
16:9,10	motion 1:13 2:2	old 10:22	paving 8:25
maker 9:10,14	2:2,2,7,10,21	olivier 3:8,9 4:9	paying 12:17
9:17 12:8	3:6,7,10,13 4:3	4:10,22 5:8,14	people 10:17,25
13:12	5:7 6:3,7 9:11	6:2,8,12,15,21	12:24 13:13
making 9:17	9:14,18 10:1,2	7:10,22 10:10	personally 16:7
14:3	10:13 12:8	12:5,6 14:1,7	piece 9:20
man 4:17,20,21	13:12 14:3	14:13	place 11:15
14:18	15:5,20,21	once 11:1	plan 8:18
manager 2:25	16:5,9,23,25	ones 12:16	please 3:10
16:13,14	move 2:2,4 5:3	opportunity	15:9
meal 10:23	12:10 16:1	4:6 8:23 14:4	point 5:1 16:8
mean 3:22,23	moving 11:25	option 5:21	pots 11:20
6:25 7:9 12:10		order 11:15	prerogative 7:9

[presented - subcommittee]

<p>presented 15:20 president 2:1 2:10,17 3:5,11 3:25 4:25 6:19 10:3 11:4 12:4 14:19,21,22,24 15:3,9 16:21 priority 11:14 probably 4:11 9:15 proceedings 17:5 projects 5:16 5:25 promise 9:23 promised 10:14 promises 8:20 9:16 prudent 5:24 public 8:13 11:13 punch 14:23 punched 14:23 purpose 3:21 5:15,20 put 8:1,2,10 9:20 13:2,14 14:14 puts 16:5 putting 2:12 6:3</p>	q	s	<p>six 8:15 15:11 somebody 4:13 15:21 16:10 sonya 17:3,12 soria 2:1,10,17 3:5,11,25 4:25 6:19 10:3 11:4 12:4 14:21,24 15:8 16:21 sort 2:25 specific 5:16,25 spend 7:2 11:24 spent 4:16,24 5:12,23 8:17 11:24 spill 7:20 splitting 4:1 spot 8:10 staff 2:25 standalone 10:15,19 stands 15:5 start 11:19 16:12 station 9:5 11:11,14,17 12:2 16:1 step 14:5 steve 14:19,22 15:3,9 stop 12:22 subcommittee 2:22,22 3:13 3:14,21 5:15</p>
	<p>quan 16:14 question 4:11 9:10 14:18 15:4 16:22 quick 4:11</p>	<p>safety 8:13 11:13 sales 2:3 6:3,18 7:2,25 saying 13:17,20 says 9:20 schecter 16:14 sean 9:13 seats 7:17 second 9:19 16:24 seconded 2:8 seconder 3:6 see 4:6 12:23 15:16,25 16:8 seems 7:15 seen 13:13,15 senior 8:7,15 9:3,7,12,21 10:10,22,23 13:2,8,16 seniors 8:21 9:17 10:16,19 10:21 12:11,11 12:25 13:3,5 13:10 14:2 service 9:3 seven 7:7 11:20 she'd 10:22 signature 17:11 signs 12:15,24 single 8:6 sits 8:6</p>	
	r	<p>r 17:1 rather 4:6 15:15 ready 8:19,20 13:23,23 record 17:5 regularly 13:4 remind 14:1 15:10 repeat 3:9 request 9:23 13:11 reserve 2:4,5 2:13 16:6,20 reserves 6:4 8:1 reset 12:9 resources 5:17 respect 12:19 respectively 5:22 result 12:12 retired 8:14 revenues 2:5 right 4:2 7:1 9:15 15:11 room 10:11 run 11:21</p>	

[subcommittee - years]

<p>5:20 subcommittee's 7:1 subject 15:12 submit 7:11 suggesting 10:14 support 6:22 6:23 7:24 10:13 11:8 12:1 16:5 supportive 16:17 sure 11:8</p>	<p>7:9 8:6 11:17 12:1 15:10,12 15:18 thing 7:11 8:11 8:12 14:25 15:14 things 3:1 4:6 8:10 think 2:11 3:25 4:11,17,19 5:23 6:19 7:12 7:13,22,23,23 7:24,25 8:1,2 9:13,15,18 11:7,11,19,20 11:21,25 12:12 12:14 thousand 10:8 thousands 13:14 three 5:10 time 2:19 4:8 5:2 times 8:5,15 10:8 today 6:9 12:11 12:12,13 13:9 15:20 16:11 took 4:3 total 4:17 totally 7:9 towards 4:7 towels 7:19 transcript 17:4</p>	<p>tree 8:25 tried 14:23 trim 8:25 trouble 11:21 true 17:4 try 6:17 7:2 two 15:22 type 15:14</p> <p style="text-align: center;">u</p> <p>ugm 4:18 unclear 3:21 understand 10:20 unspent 4:12 urge 10:9 using 11:10 utilize 11:23</p> <p style="text-align: center;">v</p> <p>value 6:25 vice 14:19,22 15:3,9 vote 3:2 7:8 9:15,19,24 10:2 12:9,10 13:18,19 15:2 15:20 16:16,23 voted 5:5 13:4 16:8 votes 15:15,25 voting 3:12</p> <p style="text-align: center;">w</p> <p>wait 7:16 want 5:6 6:22 6:25 8:9 10:20</p>	<p>13:18 14:1 16:2 wanted 2:18,19 11:2 wants 9:6,8 16:10 waving 12:15 12:24 way 6:17,23 7:2 11:9 16:2 we've 3:18 9:2 9:2,16 11:16 wear 7:14,15 week 15:15 white 8:16 13:21 willing 9:18 wilma 16:14 wish 12:13 words 13:7 work 8:16 12:22 15:16,18 working 12:17 14:25 16:17 worthy 16:7 written 15:6 wrong 11:25</p> <p style="text-align: center;">y</p> <p>yeah 2:10 3:20 4:10,21 8:24 8:25,25 11:6 years 9:14,22 10:22</p>
t			
<p>t 17:1,1 table 7:4 16:11 take 2:19 6:25 8:2,24 10:17 11:15 15:15,24 16:22 talk 14:10 talked 4:1 talking 9:13 16:12 task 8:15 13:22 tax 2:4 6:3,18 7:3,25 taxes 12:17 terms 4:4 thank 2:9 10:3 11:3,4 13:4 16:21 that's 4:8,23,24 5:6,19 6:6 7:6</p>			

Exhibit BB

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Fresno City Council Meetings
2018.11.29 FY2019 Budget Update

1 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA:
2 Councilmember Caprioglio, thank you for that.
3 I'd be supportive of that motion. I also wanted
4 to include -- if you would allow me to amend your
5 motion, to include part of the HERO Team
6 contractual line item. I'd like to -- there are
7 some other park needs that we have that are --
8 we've been working with our Parks Department and
9 kind of tiering them out, and so wanted to see if
10 we could use those also as potential. So, since
11 those other two funding sources are going to
12 PARCS, would like to include the \$420,000 for
13 additional needs in the parks -- one-time needs
14 that we have.

15 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: You
16 know, I'd be happy -- I have that list in my hand
17 here and unfortunately, we don't have enough
18 funding for all that without adjusting this great
19 opportunity with new money, but I'd be happy to
20 amend the motion to include that.

21 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Perfect.

22 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: Council
23 President, I was the second. Could you clarify
24 what you want to do with the HERO Team? What are
25 you saying?

1 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Using the
2 allocation, the 420,000, to address some of the
3 one-time needs that we have in our existing
4 neighborhood parks. We have a laundry list of
5 needs that have been presented to the
6 subcommittee that had been working on this issue,
7 and so there's a gap and I think this would help
8 do a little bit of a dent on that gap.

9 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER: So,
10 I'd like to address that needs funding, if I may.
11 So, that is a contractual obligation that should
12 have been included in the current budget, but it
13 was not, and so there is an existing agreement.
14 It's money that we are obligated to pay, and so
15 this is kind of a cleanup item, if you will. And
16 I know that we have been working with the budget
17 subcommittee, but there was a million dollars
18 that you all made a motion for and approved with
19 this current budget for just those PARCS needs
20 that Council President mentioned and we still are
21 waiting on that list from Council to move forward
22 with those. So, our recommendation would be to
23 pay off the contractual obligation we have for
24 the \$420,000.

25 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Can the

1 City Attorney weigh in on this issue? Because I
2 know that there were some questions raised prior
3 to the meeting regarding the contractual
4 obligation that is being explained to us.

5 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Right.
6 Concerning the HERO contract, we were looking --
7 we could not find a current contract payment
8 obligation. We found that there is an agreement
9 that has been extended from time to time, but not
10 a current obligation to make a payment. Plus,
11 agreements -- and we need to check -- typically
12 have a non-appropriation provision, so if the
13 Council fails to appropriate, then the contract
14 terminates anyway. So, we've not been able to
15 locate a current contract obligation.

16 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER: So,
17 City Attorney, I show that we have a fourth
18 amendment that goes until June 30th, 2019. Are
19 you seeing that on your end as well?

20 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Was that
21 approved by Council?

22 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER: I
23 just have some notes in front of me. I don't --

24 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Let us
25 check further.

1 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER:

2 Okay, thanks.

3 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: We have
4 an unexecuted version of it, so we're not sure.
5 We're going to check the original contract for a
6 non-appropriation provision, too, if you can give
7 us a couple of minutes.

8 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Okay. Is
9 there anyone --

10 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: Can we
11 take a few minutes? So, I think, City Manager,
12 one of the problems is things like the HERO Team
13 go 12, 18, sometimes 24 months without us getting
14 caught up on what they're doing, and so it
15 becomes a little sketchy for us.

16 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER:
17 Right, and I have a concern, too, because
18 defunding the HERO Team really would be
19 abandoning a lot of our homelessness efforts.
20 And so, I'm happy to bring a workshop forward so
21 that you do see the work that they're doing, but
22 I -- to me, that's problematic if we defund that.

23 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: As a
24 seconder of the motion, I'd be inclined to listen
25 to my colleagues and see what they want to do,

1 but I would be open to -- I would be open to that
2 amendment. I'd like to hear a little bit more;
3 I'd like to get clarification from the City
4 Attorney and then maybe there's another path.
5 Maybe we need to reestablish that contract if
6 it's the desire of Council, so that I am very
7 open to Council President's amendment, so I want
8 to -- I do want to get the final word on that
9 contract.

10 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: And we
11 could always come back, right? We're a few
12 months also from initiating new budget
13 negotiations, so --

14 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: Right.

15 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: But I think
16 there's an opportunity. So, if you --

17 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Council,
18 according to Gloria Myers, the fourth amendment
19 has not been executed.

20 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Okay.

21 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: Okay.

22 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: So, we're
23 not -- there's no binding agreement for us?

24 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: We're not
25 aware of any current contract obligation.

1 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Okay.

2 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: The City
3 Clerk is checking her files, too.

4 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: Okay.

5 VICE PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: So, for
6 --

7 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: I'd like to
8 move forward with it if my Council colleagues are
9 agreeable to that.

10 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: And
11 Councilman Bredefeld, you had a question about
12 the 420. Is that right? The money that Council
13 President --

14 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Well,
15 the question I have with Councilman Caprioglio:
16 you want to use the North Central 1.39 plus the
17 money that's allocated for the Crescent fountain
18 repairs, 340, so that's about 1.7 million -- is
19 that solely supposed to be used for the community
20 center?

21 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: Yeah,
22 that's correct.

23 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Okay,
24 so none of that money would be utilized in PARCS
25 for our Districts. Okay. Now, the HERO Team

1 contract -- go ahead, I'm sorry.

2 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: I was
3 just going to say, it is a community center in
4 the location of District 4, which is really, in
5 my view, the heart of the city. This location
6 would service all the Districts, especially
7 yours, mine, and Clint's --

8 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: I
9 understand.

10 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: --
11 because we're very, very close to that location.
12 That's why we selected that location.

13 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: I
14 understand. And the money you were talking about
15 for the HERO contract you wanted to put in PARCS.
16 Was that for our Districts and for different
17 needs in our different Districts for PARCS, or --

18 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER:
19 Yeah, and we have the list.

20 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: The --
21 as you recall, there was a million dollars -- I
22 don't remember the date of it, but we went
23 through the process of asking our Parks
24 Department if they would put together a list of
25 priorities from their perspective, not from us as

1 advocates, because each one of us are -- we'd
2 fall on the sword for our District to get some
3 park improvements.

4 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Sure.
5 Sure.

6 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: We all
7 understand that. So, they came back with the
8 list that I'm holding and that totaled the
9 million dollars. They also had a second part of
10 the list that says, "Other Considerations" and
11 that's what President Soria is addressing. For
12 instance, new modulars -- El Dorado at 150, JSK
13 at 25, Van Ness triangle at 50 -- thousand
14 dollars, that is, on each of these. Quigley at
15 approximately 100,000; Saint Rest at 58,000.
16 That would assist with irrigation and sod
17 improvement. So, these are the -- these are not
18 necessarily my requests or any of us in
19 particular. This is what was produced by the
20 Department and submitted to us for our review,
21 consideration, and hopeful approval.

22 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Okay,
23 and so you're talking about taking 420 and
24 applying it to those needs that there's a
25 million-dollar request there?

1 COUNCILMEMBER PAUL CAPRIOGLIO: We have
2 the million on the top features; that's been
3 approved. We're talking about the heady of other
4 considerations, which are probably about eight or
5 nine items here from various Districts -- 1, 2,
6 3, 4, 6. Sorry about 5 and 7.

7 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Okay.
8 Okay, thank you.

9 MAN 1: So, Council -- excuse me. Can
10 we consider that million-dollar list approved,
11 then? Because I know that staff was waiting for
12 the subcommittee to approve that list. So, it
13 has been approved? So, we can move forward with
14 those projects?

15 PRESIDENT ESMERALDA SORIA: If the 420
16 gets approved, yes. That list will get approved
17 plus the additional ones that we will be adding
18 today. So, conditional.

19 CITY MANAGER WILMA QUAN-SCHECTER:
20 Going back to the 420, I would like Tim Orman --
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.

Date: November 16, 2023

<%12151,Signature%>

Sonya Ledanski Hyde

[1 - consider]

1	6	appropriation 4:12 5:6	caprioglio 2:2 2:15 7:15,21 8:2,10,20 9:6 10:1
1 10:5,9 1.39 7:16 1.7 7:18 100,000 9:15 12 5:13 12151 11:11 150 9:12 16 11:6 18 5:13	6 10:6	approval 9:21	caught 5:14
	7	approve 10:12	center 7:20 8:3
	7 10:6	approved 3:18 4:21 10:3,10 10:13,16,16	central 7:16
	a	approximately 9:15	certify 11:3
	abandoning 5:19	asking 8:23	check 4:11,25 5:5
	able 4:14	assist 9:16	checking 7:3
	accurate 11:4	attorney 4:1,5 4:17,20,24 5:3 6:4,17,24 7:2 7:10	city 1:13 3:9 4:1,5,16,17,20 4:22,24 5:1,3 5:11,16 6:3,17 6:24 7:2,2,10 8:5,18 10:19
	adding 10:17	aware 6:25	clarification 6:3
2	additional 2:13 10:17	b	clarify 2:23
2 10:5 2018.11.29 1:14 2019 4:18 2023 11:6 24 5:13 25 9:13	address 3:2,10	back 6:11 9:7 10:20	cleanup 3:15
	addressing 9:11	binding 6:23	clerk 7:3
	adjusting 2:18	bit 3:8 6:2	clint's 8:7
	advocates 9:1	brandau 2:22 5:10,23 6:14 6:21 7:5	close 8:11
	agreeable 7:9	bredefeld 7:11 7:14,23 8:8,13 9:4,22 10:7	colleagues 5:25 7:8
	agreement 3:13 4:8 6:23	bring 5:20	come 6:11
	agreements 4:11	budget 1:14 3:12,16,19 6:12	community 7:19 8:3
	ahead 8:1	c	concern 5:17
	allocated 7:17	c 11:1,1	concerning 4:6
	allocation 3:2		conditional 10:18
	allow 2:4		consider 10:10
	amend 2:4,20		
	amendment 4:18 6:2,7,18		
	anyway 4:14		
	applying 9:24		
	appropriate 4:13		
3			
3 10:6 30th 4:18 340 7:18			
4			
4 8:4 10:6 420 7:12 9:23 10:15,20 420,000 2:12 3:2,24			
5			
5 10:6 50 9:13 58,000 9:15			

[consideration - jsk]

<p>consideration 9:21 considerations 9:10 10:4 contract 4:6,7 4:13,15 5:5 6:5 6:9,25 8:1,15 contractual 2:6 3:11,23 4:3 correct 7:22 council 1:13 2:22 3:20,21 4:13,21 6:6,7 6:17 7:8,12 10:9 councilman 7:11,15 councilmember 2:2,15 7:14,21 7:23 8:2,8,10 8:13,20 9:4,6 9:22 10:1,7 couple 5:7 crescent 7:17 current 3:12,19 4:7,10,15 6:25</p>	<p>different 8:16 8:17 district 8:4 9:2 districts 7:25 8:6,16,17 10:5 doing 5:14,21 dollar 9:25 10:10 dollars 3:17 8:21 9:9,14 don't 2:17 4:23 8:22 dorado 9:12 douglas 4:5,20 4:24 5:3 6:17 6:24 7:2,10</p>	<p>fails 4:13 fall 9:2 features 10:2 files 7:3 final 6:8 find 4:7 foregoing 11:4 forward 3:21 5:20 7:8 10:13 found 4:8 fountain 7:17 fourth 4:17 6:18 fresno 1:13 front 4:23 funding 2:11 2:18 3:10 further 4:25 fy2019 1:14</p>	<p>h</p> <p>hand 2:16 happy 2:16,19 5:20 heady 10:3 hear 6:2 heart 8:5 help 3:7 hero 2:5,24 4:6 5:12,18 7:25 8:15 holding 9:8 homelessness 5:19 hopeful 9:21 hyde 11:3,12</p>
<p>d</p>	<p>e</p>	<p>g</p>	<p>i</p>
<p>date 8:22 11:6 defund 5:22 defunding 5:18 dent 3:8 department 2:8 8:24 9:20 desire 6:6</p>	<p>e 11:1 efforts 5:19 eight 10:4 el 9:12 esmeralda 2:1 2:21 3:1,25 5:8 6:10,15,20,22 7:1,4,7 10:15 especially 8:6 excuse 10:9 executed 6:19 existing 3:3,13 explained 4:4 extended 4:9</p>	<p>gap 3:7,8 garry 7:14,23 8:8,13 9:4,22 10:7 getting 5:13 give 5:6 gloria 6:18 go 5:13 8:1 goes 4:18 going 2:11 5:5 8:3 10:20 great 2:18</p>	<p>improvement 9:17 improvements 9:3 inclined 5:24 include 2:4,5 2:12,20 included 3:12 initiating 6:12 instance 9:12 irrigation 9:16 issue 3:6 4:1 item 2:6 3:15 items 10:5</p>
<p>d</p>	<p>f</p>	<p>g</p>	<p>j</p>
<p>date 8:22 11:6 defund 5:22 defunding 5:18 dent 3:8 department 2:8 8:24 9:20 desire 6:6</p>	<p>f 11:1</p>	<p>g</p>	<p>jsk 9:12</p>

[june - quigley]

june 4:18	9:25 10:2,10	o	potential 2:10
k	mine 8:7	o 11:1	presented 3:5
kind 2:9 3:15	minutes 5:7,11	obligated 3:14	president 2:1
know 2:16 3:16	modulars 9:12	obligation 3:11	2:21,22,23 3:1
4:2 10:11	money 2:19	3:23 4:4,8,10	3:20,25 5:8,10
l	3:14 7:12,17	4:15 6:25	5:23 6:10,14
laundry 3:4	7:24 8:14	okay 5:2,8 6:20	6:15,20,21,22
ledanski 11:3	months 5:13	6:21 7:1,4,23	7:1,4,5,7,13
11:12	6:12	7:25 9:22 10:7	9:11 10:15
line 2:6	motion 2:3,5,20	10:8	president's 6:7
list 2:16 3:4,21	3:18 5:24	ones 10:17	prior 4:2
8:19,24 9:8,10	move 3:21 7:8	open 6:1,1,7	priorities 8:25
10:10,12,16	10:13	opportunity	probably 10:4
listen 5:24	myers 6:18	2:19 6:16	problematic
little 3:8 5:15	n	original 5:5	5:22
6:2	n 11:1	orman 10:20	problems 5:12
locate 4:15	necessarily	p	proceedings
location 8:4,5	9:18	parcs 2:12 3:19	11:5
8:11,12	need 4:11 6:5	7:24 8:15,17	process 8:23
looking 4:6	needs 2:7,13,13	park 2:7 9:3	produced 9:19
lot 5:19	3:3,5,10,19	parks 2:8,13	projects 10:14
m	8:17 9:24	3:4 8:23	provision 4:12
made 3:18	negotiations	part 2:5 9:9	5:6
make 4:10	6:13	particular 9:19	put 8:15,24
man 10:9	neighborhood	path 6:4	q
manager 3:9	3:4	paul 2:15 7:21	quan 3:9 4:16
4:16,22 5:1,11	ness 9:13	8:2,10,20 9:6	4:22 5:1,16
5:16 8:18	new 2:19 6:12	10:1	8:18 10:19
10:19	9:12	pay 3:14,23	question 7:11
meeting 4:3	nine 10:5	payment 4:7,10	7:15
meetings 1:13	non 4:12 5:6	perfect 2:21	questions 4:2
mentioned 3:20	north 7:16	perspective	quigley 9:14
million 3:17	notes 4:23	8:25	
7:18 8:21 9:9	november 11:6	plus 4:10 7:16	
		10:17	

[r - yeah]

<p>r</p> <p>r 11:1 raised 4:2 really 5:18 8:4 recall 8:21 recommenda... 3:22 record 11:5 reestablish 6:5 regarding 4:3 remember 8:22 repairs 7:18 request 9:25 requests 9:18 rest 9:15 review 9:20 right 4:5 5:17 6:11,14 7:12</p>	<p>sloan 4:5,20,24 5:3 6:17,24 7:2 7:10 sod 9:16 solely 7:19 sonya 11:3,12 soria 2:1,21 3:1 3:25 5:8 6:10 6:15,20,22 7:1 7:4,7 9:11 10:15 sorry 8:1 10:6 sources 2:11 staff 10:11 steve 2:22 5:10 5:23 6:14,21 7:5 subcommittee 3:6,17 10:12 submitted 9:20 supportive 2:3 supposed 7:19 sure 5:4 9:4,5 sword 9:2</p>	<p>that's 5:22 7:17 7:18,22 8:12 9:11 10:2 things 5:12 think 3:7 5:11 6:15 thousand 9:13 tiering 2:9 tim 10:20 time 2:13 3:3 4:9,9 today 10:18 together 8:24 top 10:2 totaled 9:8 transcript 11:4 triangle 9:13 true 11:4 two 2:11 typically 4:11</p>	<p>various 10:5 version 5:4 vice 2:22 5:10 5:23 6:14,21 7:5 view 8:5</p>
<p>s</p>	<p>t</p>	<p>u</p>	<p>w</p>
<p>saint 9:15 saying 2:25 says 9:10 schecter 3:9 4:16,22 5:1,16 8:18 10:19 second 2:23 9:9 seconder 5:24 see 2:9 5:21,25 seeing 4:19 selected 8:12 service 8:6 show 4:17 signature 11:11 sketchy 5:15</p>	<p>t 11:1,1 take 5:11 talking 8:14 9:23 10:3 team 2:5,24 5:12,18 7:25 terminates 4:14 thank 2:2 10:8 thanks 5:2</p>	<p>understand 8:9 8:14 9:7 unexecuted 5:4 unfortunately 2:17 update 1:14 use 2:10 7:16 used 7:19 using 3:1 utilized 7:24</p>	<p>waiting 3:21 10:11 want 2:24 5:25 6:7,8 7:16 wanted 2:3,9 8:15 we've 2:8 4:14 weigh 4:1 went 8:22 wilma 3:9 4:16 4:22 5:1,16 8:18 10:19 word 6:8 work 5:21 working 2:8 3:6,16 workshop 5:20</p>
		<p>v</p>	<p>y</p>
		<p>van 9:13</p>	<p>yeah 7:21 8:19</p>

Exhibit CC

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Fresno City Council Meetings
2019.03.07 Brandau's Councilmember Report

1 PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: I wanted to
2 remind my Councilmembers that our clerk sent a
3 memo this week about the forming of Council
4 subcommittees, and she's been left a little high
5 and dry by some of us as we form these
6 committees. When we form a committee on Council,
7 we need to get her the proper documentation so
8 that it can be noted. She needs to know who's
9 going to be the Chair, the Vice Chair, and
10 contact information, because a lot of these
11 committees deserve to be contacted by the public
12 and allowed to have a voice with the committee,
13 and also needs to know if it's going to be a
14 Brown Act committee, which those meetings have to
15 be held publicly.

16 We've left her a little on the spot
17 trying to figure out what's going on there, so in
18 the -- I'd like to see all of these issues --
19 we've created about maybe four or five
20 subcommittees in the -- since the beginning of
21 the year, and we need to get her that information
22 as soon as possible, so I just wanted to remind
23 you all to take a look at that memo if you
24 haven't seen it yet.

25 COUNCILMEMBER MIGUEL ARIAS: Council

1 President, to that point, it might also be a good
2 idea for us to know -- I know there was
3 committees created last year which are still
4 functional and there's even meetings that take
5 place, so we can streamline which ones exist.

6 PRESIDENT STEVE BRANDAU: Yeah, and
7 when we did in January, once a month, as you
8 know, on our agenda, we go through those
9 committees and this year we spent that time to
10 appoint new members, and I think we went through
11 them at that time, and I don't think there's any
12 that were voluntarily eliminated this year.

13 So, I think we should take a refresher
14 and see if any of those committees need to be
15 eliminated, but I'll give you an example of what
16 I'm talking about. The Cannabis Subcommittee was
17 created just through the time -- the process to
18 create the regulations. If that's going to
19 continue to be a standing committee, it needs to
20 be resubmitted the correct way, so -- because we
21 lost two Councilmembers that were on that
22 subcommittee, and so those are the type of things
23 we need to help our clerk with, so let's just
24 remember that, okay? Thank you.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.

Date: November 16, 2023

<%12151,Signature%>

Sonya Ledanski Hyde

[12151 - publicly]

1	continue 3:19	functional 3:4	m
12151 4:11	correct 3:20	g	meetings 1:13
16 4:6	council 1:13	give 3:15	2:14 3:4
2	2:3,6,25	go 3:8	members 3:10
2019.03.07 1:14	councilmember	going 2:9,13,17	memo 2:3,23
2023 4:6	1:14 2:25	3:18	miguel 2:25
a	councilmemb...	good 3:1	month 3:7
accurate 4:4	2:2 3:21	h	n
act 2:14	create 3:18	haven't 2:24	n 4:1
agenda 3:8	created 2:19	held 2:15	need 2:7,21
allowed 2:12	3:3,17	help 3:23	3:14,23
appoint 3:10	d	high 2:4	needs 2:8,13
arias 2:25	date 4:6	hyde 4:3,12	3:19
b	deserve 2:11	i	new 3:10
beginning 2:20	documentation	idea 3:2	noted 2:8
brandau 2:1	2:7	information	november 4:6
3:6	don't 3:11	2:10,21	o
brandau's 1:14	dry 2:5	issues 2:18	o 4:1
brown 2:14	e	j	okay 3:24
c	e 4:1	january 3:7	once 3:7
c 4:1,1	eliminated 3:12	k	ones 3:5
cannabis 3:16	3:15	know 2:8,13	p
certify 4:3	example 3:15	3:2,2,8	place 3:5
chair 2:9,9	exist 3:5	l	point 3:1
city 1:13	f	ledanski 4:3,12	possible 2:22
clerk 2:2 3:23	f 4:1	left 2:4,16	president 2:1
committee 2:6	figure 2:17	little 2:4,16	3:1,6
2:12,14 3:19	five 2:19	look 2:23	proceedings
committees 2:6	foregoing 4:4	lost 3:21	4:5
2:11 3:3,9,14	form 2:5,6	lot 2:10	process 3:17
contact 2:10	forming 2:3		proper 2:7
contacted 2:11	four 2:19		public 2:11
	fresno 1:13		publicly 2:15

[r - year]

r	that's 3:18 things 3:22 think 3:10,11 3:13 time 3:9,11,17 transcript 4:4 true 4:4 trying 2:17 two 3:21 type 3:22
r 4:1 record 4:5 refresher 3:13 regulations 3:18 remember 3:24 remind 2:2,22 report 1:14 resubmitted 3:20	v
s	vice 2:9 voice 2:12 voluntarily 3:12
see 2:18 3:14 seen 2:24 sent 2:2 signature 4:11 sonya 4:3,12 soon 2:22 spent 3:9 spot 2:16 standing 3:19 steve 2:1 3:6 streamline 3:5 subcommittee 3:16,22 subcommittees 2:4,20	w
	wanted 2:1,22 way 3:20 we've 2:16,19 week 2:3 went 3:10
	y
	yeah 3:6 year 2:21 3:3,9 3:12
t	
t 4:1,1 take 2:23 3:4 3:13 talking 3:16 thank 3:24	

Exhibit DD

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Fresno City Council Meetings
2022.02.10 Committee Roster Approval

1 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Let's move
2 on to Item 1-Q. City Attorney, can you provide
3 some clarification on this? We were under the
4 impression this was a, an item that needed passed
5 by Council. You had said it wasn't. Can you
6 clarify for the public what's going on with Item
7 1-Q?

8 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Yes, I
9 think I was wrong. There was some documents in
10 the record from the City Clerk's office
11 reflecting that there were some items that you
12 actually did approve as far as appointments to
13 certain positions. Is that right, City Clerk?

14 CITY CLERK TODD STERMER: Yes, yes.
15 That is correct.

16 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: So the item
17 was passed on consent agenda. And what would be
18 the process to remove that from the consent
19 agenda?

20 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Well, if
21 you wanted to by consensus discuss some of those
22 items, that would be up to the Council.

23 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Okay. So
24 that's different from what you told us. Okay.

25

1 So we -- 1-Q, as of right now, was passed on
2 consent?

3 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Correct.

4 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: We need to -
5 -

6 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN:
7 Technically, if somebody wanted to revisit a vote
8 on any part of that, somebody on the prevailing
9 side would make a motion to reconsider that item
10 and get a second majority vote to do that.

11 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: So, so
12 here, here's the thing. I don't know how this
13 process took place -- Maybe Nelson, you can
14 explain it -- I mean, I was removed from two
15 committees that I wanted to be on: the budget and
16 the homeless. I've been on them. I'm on three
17 committees. Mr. Arias is on 14. Nelson, you're
18 on nine. Maxwell, you're on six. Karbassi is on
19 seven. Chavez is on seven. And Esmeralda is on
20 seven. So I'm removed from two. Nobody talked
21 to me. I don't know if you talked to anybody or
22 you just made your own decisions. But, you know,
23 I have a problem with the fact that nobody talked
24 to me about it. I don't know if you talked to
25 anybody or you just made your own decisions. But

1 I wanted to remain on the budget committee and
2 the homeless committee. And so I don't
3 understand how the process went down.

4 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: The process
5 -- well, I sponsored the item -- so as the
6 president, the process was, I made committee
7 assignments in some consultation with the vice
8 president. But there, I'll take full
9 responsibility for the assignments since I'm the
10 one who sponsored item.

11 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Okay.
12 So then I don't understand what, what the
13 decision was to remove me from budget, as well as
14 homeless, and for Councilmember Arias to be on
15 twice as many as everyone else. And I'm on
16 three. I mean I understand I'm in the minority.
17 I got it. And I think everybody knows that I
18 know that and if that's just the decision, but I,
19 I object to the fact that I wasn't even consulted
20 or talked to about it. And it is what it is. I
21 understand the situation I'm in just like I
22 understand the way it works in Sacramento with
23 being in the minority. But I think there was a
24 better way to, to do this and at least show some
25 respect for council members who are up here, who

1 work as hard as anybody and sometimes have three
2 times the vote of anyone else on this dais.
3 Okay.

4 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Well, I mean
5 that we're not Sacramento. But you're right. I
6 had some options and I took it upon myself to
7 conduct it in the way I saw fit. So again, I
8 made the appointments. You were the only -- you
9 were not the only member not consulted. You're
10 the one obviously I think who take some issue
11 with it. So you have the right to express that.
12 But again, yeah, I take full responsibility for
13 the assignments made here today.

14 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS: I
15 don't need to be on the, on the homeless
16 committee if Councilmember Bredefeld still wants
17 to put the work in and do all that. I didn't
18 know I had seven committees, by the way. If you
19 want my seven --

20 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: I don't
21 want your seven. I wanted your one. But, no,
22 Councilmember Chavez --

23 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: Which
24 one do you want?

25

1 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Well, I
2 wanted to be on the budget and I wanted to be on
3 the homeless, which is what I was. But
4 Councilmember Chavez, I don't want you to be
5 removed if you have it. I was on there. If you
6 want to remain on it, I'm happy.

7 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: I think he's
8 offering.

9 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS: I'm
10 perfectly fine with that Councilmember Bredefeld.
11 mean it's a citywide issue. We have homeless in
12 Woodward Park and the shopping center, so I think
13 it's appropriate. I'm okay with that.

14 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Okay.

15 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: And you
16 should know that I did rename the committee just
17 from homeless to housing in general. I mean, at
18 this point, the City strategy is clear. We have
19 gone with the Housing First Policy. We know what
20 the direction and strategy is with respect to
21 unhoused individuals. So it all revolves around
22 housing pretty much. So I did rename the
23 committee to housing in general. So it won't
24 just be homeless. It'll be the whole range of

25

1 tackling the housing stock issue we have in the
2 city.

3 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Sure.

4 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: So if you
5 Councilmember Chavez, if you're okay with
6 swapping out, Councilmember Bredefeld will join
7 that committee. Do we got that clear?

8 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Mr.
9 President.

10 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Wait, we'll
11 have Karbassi and then we'll have Soria.

12 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Thank
13 you, Mr. President. So I get, I'm getting a
14 little bit of deja vu to last year. However, I
15 think that we've learned a lot from that
16 experience. Are you okay if we just go by
17 councilmember and if they have a question, we can
18 talk about it with the body out here and then
19 make these decisions? Are you okay with that?

20 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Well, I
21 mean, we -- the item has passed. I didn't really
22 want to make a thing out of it, but if folks have
23 some willing trades they want to make, I'm open
24 to hearing it.

25

1 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Okay.
2 Well, do you want to go in order? How do you
3 want to do it?

4 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: I don't want
5 to make an open order.

6 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Okay, got
7 it.

8 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: If you have
9 some interest --

10 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: So while
11 I have the floor, I have just a question. The
12 Economic Development Corporation, I've been doing
13 a lot of work with them, especially with Leanne.
14 And there's a lot of things in the works and I
15 have been booted off that. I'm an alternate,
16 which is great. But I know because of the Brown
17 Act, we couldn't talk about that. But that is a
18 problem because all those things were in the
19 queue. Not just, it's not for my district, it's
20 citywide trying to get a big employers to come
21 and things like that and things with ICSC. That
22 affects that a little bit. You know I was
23 removed from the COVID committee. That's fine.
24 I'm going to be pretty busy the next couple of
25 months anyways. And that's the only one I'm

1 really concerned about. So I'm wondering, what
2 was the, what was the thinking there on that one?

3 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: And who did
4 I appoint in place?

5 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Yourself.

6 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Myself?

7 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Right.
8 We can work together, that's fine. I don't mind
9 that. I'm just wondering what the, is there a
10 specific thing that you, you want to take care of
11 on that?

12 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: So, I mean
13 not specifics. I took a look at the committee
14 assignments. There were a number of variables
15 under consideration, right? Just sort of what
16 different levels of interest were on policy
17 areas. You know what I've seen folks kind of
18 sink their teeth into, just, you know, sort of
19 the willingness to be on committees in general.

20 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Sure.

21 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: There's a
22 list. Here we go. And so that would be number -
23 -

24 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Eight .

25

1 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Eight, the
2 EDC Corporation. So you're saying you have a
3 number of things in the pipeline, you'd like to
4 remain the primary.

5 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: I mean
6 now that we're talking in public, I'm happy to
7 work with you, especially if there are specific
8 things you're worried about and we would have
9 discussed this offline. But again, we're
10 limited. I understand.

11 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: What is the,
12 what is the time commitment on this?

13 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: They have
14 meetings. They could run fairly long or fairly
15 short once, once a month, if not more. And then
16 we have different events and things like that
17 too.

18 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: I'd be happy
19 to swap with you.

20 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: What
21 would you like?

22 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Well, not
23 swap, I mean, yes, swap but you as the primary
24 and I would be happy to be the alternate.

25

1 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: You're
2 okay with that?

3 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Yeah.

4 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: And I'll
5 just coordinate with you as we do things and keep
6 you more in the loop. And if something comes up,
7 then we can just switch. If there's a specific
8 meeting with an item you'd like. How about that?

9 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: That is
10 great with me to do that. I'm happy to do that.

11 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Yeah, I
12 appreciate you working with me on that. Awesome.

13 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: All right.

14 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: What was
15 the, what was the Joint Powers Financing
16 Authority before? I mean who was on that before?
17 Do we have that? No. Okay. So I would switch
18 with who? Who used to be on that?

19 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA:
20 Bredefeld, Esparza --

21 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Okay.
22 Got it. Okay. Okay, thank you, Councilmember.
23 Yeah, that's really all I have. Thanks very
24 much. And I appreciate you working with me, Mr.
25 President.

1 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Sure. Any
2 other requests that we may or may not
3 accommodate?

4 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: Council
5 President --

6 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Yes.

7 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: -- may
8 I just ask a question. On finance and audit
9 committee, was the intent for there just to be
10 the chair and no other members?

11 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: According to
12 the City Attorney, there is a, the process is the
13 committee appoints. I'm not sure if it's the
14 Council appoints the chair or the Council
15 President appoints the chair.

16 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: I believe
17 on that one, the Council President appoints the
18 chair, and the chair appoints the other two
19 members.

20 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: Okay,
21 so there will be other members. You just haven't
22 dealt with it yet.

23 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: Correct.
24 That will be up to the chair.

25

1 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: Okay.
2 Thank you.

3 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS:
4 Council President, I'd like to make a request
5 that we create three more committees for
6 Councilmember Chavez.

7 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Oh, man.

8 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS: The
9 committee on committees.

10 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Committee on
11 committees. Okay. Any other serious requests?
12 All right. So let, let's do this. I'm not going
13 to entertain any more requests since I don't hear
14 anymore. But what we got to do here now is back
15 up, bring back the 1-Q item formally and then
16 vote on it again with these new amendments. Is
17 that correct, City Attorney or Clerk?

18 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS: I
19 think we can make a motion to approve as amended,
20 right?

21 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN: You could
22 do that. I wanted to clarify one thing. On the
23 JPFA, that is the City Manager's appointment.

24 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: What number
25 is that?

1 CITY ATTORNEY DOUGLAS SLOAN:
2 Councilmember Karbassi mentioned it, but that is
3 the Manager's appointment, not the Council's.

4 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: 18?

5 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: 18.

6 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: City
7 Manager, are you okay with Councilmember
8 Bredefeld as the chair of that and Karbassi as
9 the second?

10 CITY MANAGER GEORGEANNA WHITE: Are
11 they, were they the previous members?

12 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: don't think
13 so. I think, I think I was.

14 CITY MANAGER GEORGEANNA WHITE: I'm
15 fine with it if they're fine with it.

16 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: It
17 looks like it used to be Bredefeld and Esparza it
18 looks like.

19 CITY MANAGER GEORGEANNA WHITE: Okay.
20 That's fine with me.

21 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: All right.
22 So we're going to approve, make a motion to
23 approve Item 1-Q with these two amendments on the
24 newly formed housing committee. We will remove
25 Chavez and add Bredefeld. On the Economic

1 Development Corporation, Representative Karbassi
2 will be the primary with Esparza as the
3 alternate.

4 COUNCIL VICE PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL:
5 Motion to approve.

6 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD: Let me
7 just, is there any willingness at all to remove
8 Arias from budget and put me on instead?

9 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Not from me,
10 no.

11 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS: I
12 I'm the fiscal conservative this year. So I stay
13 on budget.

14 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Garry, I
15 think you voted against last several budgets. So
16 we want to keep you off that one.

17 COUNCILMEMBER GARRY BREDEFELD:
18 Diversity is important.

19 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS:
20 Don't worry, Garry. I'm going to be anti-tax
21 this year, so I got you.

22 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: I might
23 remove Arias at some point along the year too.
24 So don't take it personally.

25

1 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: The man
2 is on 14 of them.

3 CITY CLERK TODD STERMER: We have a, we
4 have a motion. Is there a second?

5 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: I'll
6 second.

7 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: All right,
8 we have a second.

9 COUNCILMEMBER ESMERALDA SORIA: And I
10 want say thank you for not putting me on all
11 committees. Actually, I was pleasantly surprised
12 that my load is light, thanks.

13 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: All right.
14 Yeah. Like I said, there are a number of
15 considerations when making these assignments and
16 looks like it mostly worked out with a few
17 disappointments, but mostly worked out. All
18 right. Any opposition to the amended 1-Q?

19 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: No. And
20 I want to thank Councilmember Chavez as well.

21 PRESIDENT NELSON ESPARZA: Okay. Item
22 passes. And that puts us at the end of consent
23 altogether at 2:47 p.m. Congrats Council,
24 congrats.

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, certify that the
foregoing transcript is a true and accurate
record of the proceedings.

Date: November 16, 2023

<%12151,Signature%>
Sonya Ledanski Hyde

[1 - congrats]

1	anti 15:20	awesome 11:12	city 1:13 2:2,8
1 2:2,7 3:1 13:15 14:23 16:18 12151 17:11 14 3:17 16:2 16 17:6 18 14:4,5	anybody 3:21 3:25 5:1 anymore 13:14 anyways 8:25 appoint 9:4 appointment 13:23 14:3 appointments 2:12 5:8 appoints 12:13 12:14,15,17,18 appreciate 11:12,24 appropriate 6:13 approval 1:14 approve 2:12 13:19 14:22,23 15:5 areas 9:17 arias 3:17 4:14 5:14 6:9 13:3,8 13:18 15:8,11 15:19,23 assignments 4:7,9 5:13 9:14 16:15 attorney 2:2,8 2:20 3:3,6 12:12,16,23 13:17,21 14:1 audit 12:8 authority 11:16	b	2:10,13,14,20 3:3,6 6:18 7:2 12:12,16,23 13:17,21,23 14:1,6,10,14,19 16:3 citywide 6:11 8:20 clarification 2:3 clarify 2:6 13:22 clear 6:18 7:7 clerk 2:13,14 13:17 16:3 clerk's 2:10 come 8:20 comes 11:6 commitment 10:12 committee 1:14 4:1,2,6 5:16 6:16,23 7:7 8:23 9:13 12:9 12:13 13:9,10 14:24 committees 3:15,17 5:18 9:19 13:5,9,11 16:11 concerned 9:1 conduct 5:7 congrats 16:23 16:24
2			
2022.02.10 1:14 2023 17:6 2:47 16:23		back 13:14,15 believe 12:16 better 4:24 big 8:20 bit 7:14 8:22 body 7:18 booted 8:15 bredefeld 3:11 4:11 5:16,20 6:1,10,14 7:3,6 11:20 14:8,17 14:25 15:6,17 bring 13:15 brown 8:16 budget 3:15 4:1 4:13 6:2 15:8 15:13 budgets 15:15 busy 8:24	
a		c	
accommodate 12:3 accurate 17:4 act 8:17 actually 2:12 16:11 add 14:25 affects 8:22 agenda 2:17,19 alternate 8:15 10:24 15:3 altogether 16:23 amended 13:19 16:18 amendments 13:16 14:23 angel 5:14 6:9 13:3,8,18 15:11,19		c 17:1,1 care 9:10 center 6:12 certain 2:13 certify 17:3 chair 12:10,14 12:15,18,18,24 14:8 chavez 3:19 5:22 6:4 7:5 13:6 14:25 16:20	

[consensus - great]

consensus 2:21 consent 2:17,18 3:2 16:22 conservative 15:12 consideration 9:15 considerations 16:15 consultation 4:7 consulted 4:19 5:9 coordinate 11:5 corporation 8:12 10:2 15:1 correct 2:15 3:3 12:23 13:17 council 1:13 2:5,22 4:25 12:4,14,14,17 13:4 15:4 16:23 council's 14:3 councilmember 3:11 4:11,14 5:14,16,20,22 5:23 6:1,4,9,10 6:14 7:3,5,6,8 7:12,17 8:1,6 8:10 9:5,7,20 9:24 10:5,13 10:20 11:1,4	11:11,14,19,21 11:22 12:4,7 12:20 13:1,3,6 13:8,18 14:2,5 14:7,16 15:6 15:11,17,19 16:1,5,9,19,20 couple 8:24 covid 8:23 create 13:5	e e 17:1 economic 8:12 14:25 edc 10:2 eight 9:24 10:1 employers 8:20 entertain 13:13 esmeralda 3:19 5:23 11:19 12:4,7,20 13:1 14:5,16 16:9 esparza 2:1,16 2:23 3:4 4:4 5:4 6:7,15 7:4 7:10,20 8:4,8 9:3,6,12,21 10:1,11,18,22 11:3,9,13,20 12:1,6,11 13:7 13:10,24 14:4 14:6,12,17,21 15:2,9,14,22 16:7,13,21 especially 8:13 10:7 events 10:16 everybody 4:17 experience 7:16 explain 3:14 express 5:11	fairly 10:14,14 far 2:12 finance 12:8 financing 11:15 fine 6:10 8:23 9:8 14:15,15 14:20 first 6:19 fiscal 15:12 fit 5:7 floor 8:11 folks 7:22 9:17 foregoing 17:4 formally 13:15 formed 14:24 fresno 1:13 full 4:8 5:12
	d dais 5:2 date 17:6 dealt 12:22 decision 4:13 4:18 decisions 3:22 3:25 7:19 deja 7:14 development 8:12 15:1 different 2:24 9:16 10:16 direction 6:20 disappointme... 16:17 discuss 2:21 discussed 10:9 district 8:19 diversity 15:18 documents 2:9 doing 8:12 douglas 2:8,20 3:3,6 12:16,23 13:21 14:1	f f 17:1 fact 3:23 4:19	g garry 3:11 4:11 5:20 6:1,14 7:3 15:6,14,17,20 general 6:17,23 9:19 georgeanna 14:10,14,19 getting 7:13 go 7:16 8:2 9:22 going 2:6 8:24 13:12 14:22 15:20 great 8:16 11:10

[happy - number]

h	joint 11:15 jpfa 13:23	loop 11:6 lot 7:15 8:13,14	mind 9:8 minority 4:16 4:23 miquel 5:14 6:9 13:3,8,18 15:11,19 month 10:15 months 8:25 motion 3:9 13:19 14:22 15:5 16:4 move 2:1
happy 6:6 10:6 10:18,24 11:10 hard 5:1 hear 13:13 hearing 7:24 homeless 3:16 4:2,14 5:15 6:3 6:11,17,24 housing 6:17 6:19,22,23 7:1 14:24 hyde 17:3,12	k karbassi 3:18 7:8,11,12 8:1,6 8:10 9:5,7,20 9:24 10:5,13 10:20 11:1,4 11:11,14,21 14:2,8 15:1 16:1,5,19 keep 11:5 15:16 kind 9:17 know 3:12,21 3:22,24 4:18 5:18 6:16,19 8:16,22 9:17 9:18 knows 4:17	m made 3:22,25 4:6 5:8,13 majority 3:10 make 3:9 7:19 7:22,23 8:5 13:4,19 14:22 making 16:15 man 13:7 16:1 manager 14:7 14:10,14,19 manager's 13:23 14:3 maxwell 3:18 15:4 mean 3:14 4:16 5:4 6:11,17 7:21 9:12 10:5 10:23 11:16 meeting 11:8 meetings 1:13 10:14 member 5:9 members 4:25 12:10,19,21 14:11 mentioned 14:2 mike 7:8,12 8:1 8:6,10 9:5,7,20 9:24 10:5,13 10:20 11:1,4 11:11,14,21 16:1,5,19	n n 17:1 need 3:4 5:15 needed 2:4 nelson 2:1,16 2:23 3:4,13,17 4:4 5:4 6:7,15 7:4,10,20 8:4,8 9:3,6,12,21 10:1,11,18,22 11:3,9,13 12:1 12:6,11 13:7 13:10,24 14:4 14:6,12,21 15:9,14,22 16:7,13,21 new 13:16 newly 14:24 nine 3:18 november 17:6 number 9:14 9:22 10:3 13:24 16:14
i	l leanne 8:13 learned 7:15 ledanski 17:3 17:12 levels 9:16 light 16:12 limited 10:10 list 9:22 little 7:14 8:22 load 16:12 long 10:14 look 9:13 looks 14:17,18 16:16		
icsc 8:21 important 15:18 impression 2:4 individuals 6:21 intent 12:9 interest 8:9 9:16 issue 5:10 6:11 7:1 it'll 6:24 item 2:2,4,6,16 3:9 4:5,10 7:21 11:8 13:15 14:23 16:21 items 2:11,22			
j			
join 7:6			

[o - sloan]

<p>o</p>	<p>pleasantly</p>	<p>provide 2:2</p>	<p>responsibility</p>
<p>o 17:1 object 4:19 obviously 5:10 offering 6:8 office 2:10 offline 10:9 oh 13:7 okay 2:23,24 4:11 5:3 6:13 6:14 7:5,16,19 8:1,6 11:2,17 11:21,22,22 12:20 13:1,11 14:7,19 16:21 once 10:15,15 open 7:23 8:5 opposition 16:18 options 5:6 order 8:2,5 own 3:22,25</p>	<p>16:11 point 6:18 15:23 policy 6:19 9:16 positions 2:13 powers 11:15 president 2:1 2:16,23 3:4 4:4 4:6,8 5:4 6:7 6:15 7:4,9,10 7:13,20 8:4,8 9:3,6,12,21 10:1,11,18,22 11:3,9,13,25 12:1,5,6,11,15 12:17 13:4,7 13:10,24 14:4 14:6,12,21 15:4,9,14,22 16:7,13,21</p>	<p>public 2:6 10:6 put 5:17 15:8 puts 16:22 putting 16:10</p>	<p>4:9 5:12 revisit 3:7 revolves 6:21 right 2:13 3:1 5:5,11 9:7,15 11:13 13:12,20 14:21 16:7,13 16:18 roster 1:14 run 10:14</p>
<p>p</p>	<p>pretty 6:22 8:24</p>	<p>q</p>	<p>s</p>
<p>p.m. 16:23 park 6:12 part 3:8 passed 2:4,17 3:1 7:21 passes 16:22 perfectly 6:10 personally 15:24 pipeline 10:3 place 3:13 9:4</p>	<p>prevailing 3:8 previous 14:11 primary 10:4 10:23 15:2 problem 3:23 8:18 proceedings 17:5 process 2:18 3:13 4:3,4,6 12:12</p>	<p>question 7:17 8:11 12:8 queue 8:19</p>	<p>sacramento 4:22 5:5 saw 5:7 saying 10:2 second 3:10 14:9 16:4,6,8 seen 9:17 serious 13:11 seven 3:19,19 3:20 5:18,19 5:21 several 15:15 shopping 6:12 short 10:15 show 4:24 side 3:9 signature 17:11 sink 9:18 situation 4:21 six 3:18 sloan 2:8,20 3:3 3:6 12:16,23 13:21 14:1</p>
<p>r</p>	<p>remove 2:18 4:13 14:24 15:7,23</p>	<p>r</p>	<p>six 3:18</p>
<p>r</p>	<p>removed 3:14 3:20 6:5 8:23</p>	<p>r 17:1 range 6:24 really 7:21 9:1 11:23 reconsider 3:9 record 2:10 17:5 reflecting 2:11 remain 4:1 6:6 10:4</p>	<p>rename 6:16,22 representative 15:1 request 13:4 requests 12:2 13:11,13 respect 4:25 6:20</p>

[somebody - year]

<p>somebody 3:7,8 sonya 17:3,12 soria 5:23 7:11 11:19 12:4,7 12:20 13:1 14:5,16 16:9 sort 9:15,18 specific 9:10 10:7 11:7 specifics 9:13 sponsored 4:5 4:10 stay 15:12 stermer 2:14 16:3 stock 7:1 strategy 6:18 6:20 sure 7:3 9:20 12:1,13 surprised 16:11 swap 10:19,23 10:23 swapping 7:6 switch 11:7,17</p>	<p>talking 10:6 tax 15:20 technically 3:7 teeth 9:18 thank 7:12 11:22 13:2 16:10,20 thanks 11:23 16:12 thing 3:12 7:22 9:10 13:22 things 8:14,18 8:21,21 10:3,8 10:16 11:5 think 2:9 4:17 4:23 5:10 6:7 6:12 7:15 13:19 14:12,13 14:13 15:15 thinking 9:2 three 3:16 4:16 5:1 13:5 time 10:12 times 5:2 today 5:13 todd 2:14 16:3 together 9:8 told 2:24 took 3:13 5:6 9:13 trades 7:23 transcript 17:4 true 17:4 trying 8:20</p>	<p>twice 4:15 two 3:14,20 12:18 14:23 tyler 15:4</p> <p style="text-align: center;">u</p> <p>under 2:3 9:15 understand 4:3 4:12,16,21,22 10:10 unhoused 6:21 used 11:18 14:17</p> <p style="text-align: center;">v</p> <p>variables 9:14 vice 4:7 15:4 vote 3:7,10 5:2 13:16 voted 15:15 vu 7:14</p> <p style="text-align: center;">w</p> <p>wait 7:10 want 5:19,21 5:24 6:4,6 7:22 7:23 8:2,3,4 9:10 15:16 16:10,20 wanted 2:21 3:7,15 4:1 5:21 6:2,2 13:22 wants 5:16 way 4:22,24 5:7 5:18 we've 7:15</p>	<p>went 4:3 white 14:10,14 14:19 willing 7:23 willingness 9:19 15:7 wondering 9:1 9:9 woodward 6:12 work 5:1,17 8:13 9:8 10:7 worked 16:16 16:17 working 11:12 11:24 works 4:22 8:14 worried 10:8 worry 15:20 wrong 2:9</p> <p style="text-align: center;">y</p> <p>yeah 5:12 11:3 11:11,23 16:14 year 7:14 15:12 15:21,23</p>
t			
<p>t 17:1,1 tackling 7:1 take 4:8 5:10 5:12 9:10 15:24 talk 7:18 8:17 talked 3:20,21 3:23,24 4:20</p>			

Exhibit EE

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Fresno City Council Meetings
2023.06.05 Budget Overview

1 DIRECTOR HENRY FIERRO Good morning,
2 Council President, Councilmembers. First of all,
3 can you hear me okay? Perfect. Henry Fierro
4 budget director. Today begins the FY 24 budget
5 review hearings. I will be providing a general
6 fund overview. Then we'll proceed with
7 departmental presentations.

8 Before I start though, the general
9 overview, there are a couple of items I just want
10 to walk through as far as procedures. So the
11 format for the reviews will be the same as we had
12 conducted last year. And just real quickly some
13 bullet points that I'd like to share. The
14 department directors will present an overview of
15 their department's budget. If Council has any
16 specific questions concerning the department's
17 budget operations, et cetera, the department
18 director and staff will be here to answer those
19 questions.

20 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: I appreciate
21 that. And I'm going to ask my colleagues too
22 that we allow each department director to get
23 through their presentation before we begin
24 questions and comments.

25 DIRECTOR HENRY FIERRO Perfect. Thank

1 you. Next is if a Councilmember wishes to make a
2 motion to change the budget, they can do so at
3 any time during the budget hearing. However, a
4 motion must get a second to be recorded by my
5 staff and the City Clerk to be on the motion
6 list. As provided in previous hearings, formal
7 submission of the motion via email would greatly
8 help us to make sure we're capturing the specific
9 verbiage that's being created for the motion. So
10 I highly ask that if we could do that.

11 And the goal for us is to then publish
12 the motion and direction list the same day of
13 these hearings. So as soon as you can provide us
14 that email, we'll get that incorporated so we can
15 then hopefully distribute it ASAP, at the end of
16 the day.

17 Also Councilmembers can make a request
18 for information at the dais. Again, I'm asking
19 if we can get that in writing as well via email,
20 so we can make sure we're getting the verbiage as
21 accurately as possible. And then also we will
22 distribute again motions and directions at the
23 end of the day.

24 And then with that Council motions are
25 scheduled to be voted on Wednesday, June 14th.

1 After the list of motions are voted on and
2 approved, the budget office will then go back and
3 then cost out the motions that have been
4 approved.

5 One thing I want to point out though is
6 as observed in prior years, if the approved
7 costing creates a deficit in the general fund,
8 then Council's Budget Subcommittee with the
9 Administration will then need to meet, work
10 through a budget worksheet reconciliation so then
11 we can then realign the general fund budget back
12 in balance and then a follow-up motion will be
13 needed to then be approved so we can then balance
14 the budget and then allow my staff and I then to
15 create the enabling documents of the balanced
16 budget. And that will be voted on Thursday, June
17 22nd.

18 And then finally on Thursday, June
19 29th, it is reserved, if needed, for a final
20 budget vote.

21 And then the last item, it's a
22 housekeeping item. And that is to note we begin
23 is to formally report per the Transparency Act
24 the listings of elected officials and employee
25 earnings, consultant disclosure, and benchmark

1 city data are on the city's website under the
2 personnel departments section.

3 So with that, now I'm going to move
4 over to the general fund overview. So the flow
5 of this overview is I'm going to start off with
6 budgeted revenue specifically for the general
7 fund. We'll cover the main categories. We'll
8 also go into each category in a little more in
9 depth discussion. Once we go through the
10 revenues, then we'll look at and share the
11 general fund expenditures by department.

12 So let me see here. Okay. So Slide 2.
13 It's an illustration of our FY 24 proposed
14 budgeted, again, general fund revenues totaling
15 481.7 million. And as you can see on this pie
16 chart, the largest contributor to our general
17 fund revenues is our property tax at 174.1
18 million or 30 per -- 36.1 percent of our various
19 revenue categories.

20 The second major category then is our
21 sales tax, which is 153.6 million or roughly 32
22 percent of our total revenue sources. I'm going
23 to slide -- move to the next slide which will
24 give us a little historical trend.

25 And again, it's the same categories.

1 It starts off with prior year carryover. And
2 then below that, you're going to see then what we
3 call our ongoing revenue sources, starting with
4 sales tax, property tax, then business license,
5 room tax, so on and so forth. Historically, we
6 have been growing, as you can see from '22 to
7 '21, overall, we grew almost 13.5 percent. And
8 then from '22 to '23 we look to grow by 5.4
9 percent. And then from '23 estimate to '24
10 proposed, we're actually dipping, reduced or
11 declining by 3.1 percent. And I'll explain that
12 decline in a second here. So I'd like to then
13 move on and then start discussing the individual
14 revenue categories.

15 Oh, if I may point out, too, if you
16 look at the sales tax line, you'll see that the
17 annual change is 1.9 percent growth. What you
18 have to keep in mind is in the sales tax
19 category, we have economic incentives that we are
20 also budgeting for payouts. So if you exclude
21 the economic incentives, the sales tax is
22 actually growing at 2.5 percent. But once we
23 incorporate those payments, then it brings it
24 down to 1.9.

25 This next slide actually is a further

1 breakdown of all other revenue. And you'll see
2 that it's encompassing our franchise fees. We
3 have what's called intergovernmental. Along with
4 that is in intragovernmental, along with
5 cannabis, Prop 172, real estate transfer tax,
6 card room. And so the goal was to look at where
7 we're headed through FY '23 based on those
8 trends, carry that over into to '24.

9 Now, if you look at cannabis, you'll
10 see how it's from 1,168,900 in FY '23 while it's
11 now growing to 5,381,400. The growth behind that
12 is our estimates are based on two facilities.
13 However, in '24, we're projecting that it will go
14 from 2 to 11. So that's what's driving that
15 revenue growth.

16 You'll also see card room. I wanted to
17 point that one out as well as we're anticipating
18 to land at just over a million dollars in FY '23.
19 And again, that is based on what's actually come
20 in the door with just a little bit of time left
21 to complete the year or should be just about
22 breaking a million. And having said that, I'm
23 using that same trend in carrying that over into
24 '24. So I think we're in a good spot to, to hit
25 that million dollar mark.

1 And then in all other, it's a, it's
2 just a compilation of various activities that,
3 for example, within that million seven, we have
4 what's called a portfolio fee and what that is,
5 that's worth half a million of that 1.7 million.
6 And that is, we have a treasury unit that
7 oversees the City's cash. And so in essence, for
8 their services, they're receiving half a million
9 of the interest generated.

10 And along with that, we've got some
11 other minor categories like, for example, there's
12 about 300,000 for blight removal, another 200,000
13 for fencing of properties. And along with that,
14 there's probably another couple hundred thousand
15 at the regional -- sorry, it's the parks facility
16 and I'm trying to -- bear with me Council. It's
17 their sports center. Thank you. There, there is
18 metering for a solid waste adjacent facility. So
19 parks actually pays that metering cost on behalf
20 of DPU, but DPU provides them a reimbursement
21 through this revenue. So with all of that, I
22 mean, again, it's 1.7 million. And in comparison
23 to the total city revenue, it's under 1 percent.
24 So while it's 100 million, still relatively, it's
25 somewhat small compared to the bigger categories.

1 Now, this next slide is the sales tax
2 and what I wanted to show is some historical
3 trend of the, if you will, you'll see primarily a
4 growth starting from 2015 to the budget of 2024.
5 But I also wanted to show how, with actuals, what
6 the relative budget was for each given fiscal
7 year. So you can kind of have a comparison of
8 what did we budget and how did we end up the
9 fiscal year. For the most part, we pretty much
10 were either just above or at. As you move
11 forward in time, you'll see that in FY '23, we
12 are utilizing MuniServices guidance. However,
13 we're also seeking to, to bump it up just a
14 little more. We're trying to access as much
15 sales tax as we believe we can receive.

16 Muni has -- provides us multiple
17 scenarios and they allow us to say here we think
18 is somewhat most likely. Here is what we think
19 is optimistic. And we're kind of just above the
20 most likely, but we're not at the optimistic. So
21 we're really trying to access as much sales tax
22 in our projections.

23 And with that, just a little
24 background. In their analysis, they do provide
25 us some statistics like of our sales tax, we have

1 31 business segments which nearly account for 61
2 percent of the total sales tax. And within that,
3 you'll see the breakdown by major business
4 category. Retail is almost 27 percent.
5 Department stores, restaurants are about 10
6 percent. And then new auto sales will bring in
7 about 8 percent followed up by building materials
8 at 6 percent.

9 The '24 projection does reflect what we
10 anticipate of a further slowing in growth. We're
11 still growing but not growing as fast as we have
12 observed in the prior years. And again, that has
13 a correlation to the current environment of the
14 inflationary impacts to our consumer spending
15 along with the growth in our borrowing costs in
16 the environment. So we're trying to keep that in
17 mind as we're building a '24 sales tax
18 projection. Just one moment, Councilmembers.

19 ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER RUTHIE QUINTO:
20 Good, good morning. Thank you. Thank you, TJ.
21 I want -- this is Ruthie and I wanted to just
22 make sure to provide a little bit more context
23 regarding the current year sales tax estimates,
24 The estimates for FY '23. I remind the Council
25 that we did have a longer discussion about this

1 during the midyear budget and noted that we are
2 pulling back for the current year estimates off
3 of what MuniServices had originally projected for
4 the year in their most likely scenario. We are
5 mainly going on and continue to go on the
6 receipts that we have actually collected at this
7 time. And that's the main reason for the
8 guidance to be under that blue line that you see
9 there for the current year.

10 In addition, we are then utilizing
11 that as our base for growth for next year. So it
12 is different from the MuniServices report. It's
13 a little more optimistic than what they are
14 recommending at this time. But it's such a wide
15 swing from year over year over the past several
16 years in particular, we thought it would be
17 better to go with what we know and base next
18 year's projection on what we've actually
19 received, even though it's a little higher, about
20 1.5 million higher than what they're recommending
21 at this time for the current year.

22 Additionally, for next year, they did
23 not recommend 2.5 percent growth. They
24 recommended something less, almost 1 percent, I
25 believe 0.8 percent. And rather than take that

1 again down, again, a wild -- not wild but a more
2 significant swing, we are smoothing out the five-
3 year projection. And so in the budget book under
4 the general fund summary, you can see that we do
5 have five-year projections. And that fifth year
6 of the sales tax number is the MuniServices most
7 likely scenario. And so just getting from the
8 current year, or the budget year, pardon me, to
9 that point is more of a smoothed out line rather
10 than to have more significant changes year over
11 year from here to there. So hopefully, that's
12 helpful and gives you a little bit of an idea of
13 how we didn't take exactly what they said
14 verbatim, but instead used a little bit more of
15 an analysis and other things into consideration
16 as we were making those projections. Thank you.

17 DIRECTOR HENRY FIERRO Council, I'm
18 going to move to the next slide and that is
19 similar to sales tax, it is now property tax
20 showing you, again, some historical trend going
21 back from 2015 to the 2024 proposed budget. And
22 again, if you look at the visual here, you are
23 seeing how we are growing. We are growing year
24 to year. With that in '24 we are projecting a
25 4.2 percent growth over the '23 estimate. The

1 '23 estimate is -- it was built based on the
2 latest assessed values that was published in July
3 of '22 from the assessor's office. So again,
4 Assessor's office established our '23 estimate.
5 From there, we built in a 4.2 percent in '24.

6 What this slide represents is the
7 business tax and room tax. But what I wanted to
8 show here is the relationship of these two
9 revenue categories in comparison to the sales tax
10 because there is this natural correlation that
11 takes place and the movement of sales tax pretty
12 much you can then see the same movement with
13 these two categories. So there is growth within
14 those two. And, again, we want to peg it to how
15 we believe sales tax will move going forward. It
16 just seems like it's measuring pretty well
17 historically. We want to apply it in the future.

18 And this slide is just a table to show
19 a little bit of the history and the relationship
20 again of business tax and room tax in relation to
21 sales tax. The one thing I do want to point out
22 with the room tax is in FY '24 we did program an
23 additional million dollars and that is in
24 correlation to the recent transit occupation tax
25 and it was amended per the Code Section 7-602.

1 Now moving from revenues to now
2 department appropriation specifically for the FY
3 '24 proposed budget, in total you'll see then it
4 adds up to 457.3 million. Through this visual,
5 you'll see that public safety is our primary use
6 of the source, and then further broken down by
7 the various departments.

8 In line with the pie chart, this next
9 table then shows by department and then some
10 historical actuals, where we estimate the
11 departments to land, and then what we're
12 budgeting again in '24. Overall, there is a
13 growth of about 2.4 percent. The appropriations,
14 they do include that we fully funded, if you
15 will, we accounted for any MOUs. So we built
16 those in the budget accordingly by the bargain
17 units/departments.

18 One thing also I want to point out,
19 Council, is under general city purpose, you'll
20 see how that number is actually a negative
21 number. The reason for that is we also accounted
22 for our attrition rate. Historically, it's been
23 running between 10 and 13. We built an attrition
24 rate in the budget at 10 percent. So with that,
25 that equated to about a 32.1 million attrition

1 savings, the reason being that's why the general
2 city purpose then shows that negative 20.6.

3 Council, that concludes the general
4 fund overview presentation. I will stop there
5 and if there's any questions.

6 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: I appreciate
7 it. Thank you for the presentation. We do have
8 some folks queued up at this time starting with
9 Councilmember KARBASSI.

10 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: All
11 right, first up. Thank you so much. First off,
12 I want to thank the Mayor. I know you gave us a
13 little bit of an earlier budget this year. This
14 made a big difference and I do -- it's a double
15 edged sword. But I tell you what, as a member of
16 the budget committee, I do appreciate that. And
17 thank you to staff. You guys have been working
18 this a long time. So here we go. Okay. A
19 couple of questions. So I'm always concerned and
20 nervous about revenue. That's just the way I was
21 raised growing up in a small business. Some
22 months you don't have money and you got to save.
23 Now, thankfully, we have good reserves. But
24 talking about our sales tax, sales tax revenue,
25 can you tell me a little bit more about how we

1 arrived at that number? Because I just want to
2 make sure we're on target. I worry coming back
3 and maybe you're saying, oh, we weren't -- I know
4 you touched on that, Ruthie, a moment ago. We're
5 not quite there and we have to go back and
6 account for that. Because what I'm reading is
7 more people are moving towards services now,
8 which aren't taxed. So how confident are we in
9 our numbers when it comes to that? You said it
10 was only about a million dollars off than the
11 more conservative Muni estimate?

12 ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER RUTHIE QUINTO:
13 Can you hear me now? Oh, it takes a second.
14 Okay. It's up. There we go. Thank you. I'll
15 get used to this technology. So, yes. So the
16 more conservative projection for the current year
17 would be about 1.5 million off of the gross
18 amount. But again, that incorporates future
19 losses or amounts in the future that are actually
20 less than what, what we believe that we will
21 collect. So as every month goes by, we get a
22 little closer to the estimate and feel even more
23 confident that we'll get to that number for FY
24 23.

25 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: And we

1 constantly track that to make sure we're on
2 target.

3 ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER RUTHIE QUINTO:
4 Every month.

5 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Will that
6 be something, maybe quarterly, that we share with
7 the Budget Committee? I don't know if it's been
8 done before, but that might be helpful because we
9 can just be aware of what's to come.

10 ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER RUTHIE QUINTO:
11 Sure. We can make it a standing item to go over
12 the quarterly projections when we get that
13 analysis.

14 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Okay.
15 That helps a lot.

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
C E R T I F I C A T I O N
2
3 I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, certify that the
4 foregoing transcript is a true and accurate
5 record of the proceedings.
6

Date: November 16, 2023

<%12151,Signature%>
Sonya Ledanski Hyde

[0.8 - appropriations]

0	20 18:21	4	8:19 11:6,18
0.8 11:25	20.6. 15:2	4 18:5	14:20 16:19
1	200,000 8:12	4.2 12:25 13:5	actuals 9:5
1 8:23 11:24	2015 9:4 12:21	457.3 14:4	14:10
18:1	2023 18:7	481.7 5:15	addition 11:10
1,168,900 7:10	2023.06.05 1:14	5	additional
1.5 11:20 16:17	2024 9:4 12:21	5 18:6	13:23
1.7 8:5,22	21 6:7 18:22	5,381,400 7:11	additionally
1.9 6:17	22 6:6,8 13:3	5.4 6:8	11:22
1.9. 6:24	18:23	6	adds 14:4
10 10:5 14:23	22nd 4:17	6 10:8 18:7	adjacent 8:18
14:24 18:11	23 6:8,9 7:7,10	61 10:1	administration
100 8:24	7:18 9:11	7	4:9
11 7:14 18:12	10:24 12:25	7 18:8	ago 16:4
12 18:13	13:1,4 16:24	7-602 13:25	allow 2:22 4:14
12151 18:12	18:24	8	9:17
13 14:23 18:14	24 2:4 5:13 6:9	8 10:7 18:9	amended 13:25
13.5 6:7	7:8,13,24 10:9	9	amount 16:18
14 18:15	10:17 12:24	9 18:10	amounts 16:19
14th 3:25	13:5,22 14:3	a	analysis 9:24
15 18:16	14:12 18:25	above 9:10,19	12:15 17:13
153.6 5:21	25 18:25	access 9:14,21	annual 6:17
16 18:7,17	27 10:4	account 10:1	answer 2:18
17 18:18	29th 4:19	16:6	anticipate
172 7:5	3	accounted	10:10
174.1 5:17	3 18:4	14:15,21	anticipating
18 18:19	3.1 6:11	accurate 18:5	7:17
19 18:20	30 5:18	accurately 3:21	apply 13:17
2	300,000 8:12	act 4:23	appreciate 2:20
2 5:12 7:14	31 10:1	activities 8:2	15:6,16
18:3	32 5:21	actually 6:10	appropriation
2.4 14:13	32.1 14:25	6:22,25 7:19	14:2
2.5 6:22 11:23	36.1 5:18		appropriations
			14:13

[approved - contributor]

<p>approved 4:2,4 4:6,13 arrived 16:1 asap 3:15 asking 3:18 assessed 13:2 assessor's 13:3 13:4 assistant 10:19 16:12 17:3,10 attrition 14:22 14:23,25 auto 10:6 aware 17:9</p>	<p>better 11:17 big 15:14 bigger 8:25 bit 7:20 10:22 12:12,14 13:19 15:13,25 blight 8:12 blue 11:8 book 12:3 borrowing 10:15 breakdown 7:1 10:3 breaking 7:22 bring 10:6 brings 6:23 broken 14:6 budget 1:14 2:4 2:4,15,17 3:2,3 4:2,8,10,11,14 4:16,20 9:4,6,8 11:1 12:3,8,21 14:3,16,24 15:13,16 17:7 budgeted 5:6 5:14 budgeting 6:20 14:12 building 10:7 10:17 built 13:1,5 14:15,23 bullet 2:13 bump 9:13</p>	<p>business 6:4 10:1,3 13:7,20 15:21</p> <p style="text-align: center;">c</p> <p>c 18:2,2 call 6:3 called 7:3 8:4 cannabis 7:5,9 capturing 3:8 card 7:6,16 carry 7:8 carrying 7:23 carryover 6:1 cash 8:7 categories 5:7 5:19,25 6:14 8:11,25 13:9 13:13 category 5:8,20 6:19 10:4 center 8:17 certify 18:4 cetera 2:17 change 3:2 6:17 changes 12:10 chart 5:16 14:8 city 1:13 3:5 5:1 8:23 10:19 14:19 15:2 16:12 17:3,10 city's 5:1 8:7 clerk 3:5 closer 16:22 code 13:25</p>	<p>colleagues 2:21 collect 16:21 collected 11:6 come 7:19 17:9 comes 16:9 coming 16:2 comments 2:24 committee 15:16 17:7 compared 8:25 comparison 8:22 9:7 13:9 compilation 8:2 complete 7:21 concerned 15:19 concerning 2:16 concludes 15:3 conducted 2:12 confident 16:8 16:23 conservative 16:11,16 consideration 12:15 constantly 17:1 consultant 4:25 consumer 10:14 context 10:22 continue 11:5 contributor 5:16</p>
b			
<p>back 4:2,11 11:2 12:21 16:2,5 background 9:24 balance 4:12,13 balanced 4:15 bargain 14:16 base 11:11,17 based 7:7,12,19 13:1 bear 8:16 begins 2:4 behalf 8:19 believe 9:15 11:25 13:15 16:20 benchmark 4:25</p>			

[correlation - fully]

<p>correlation 10:13 13:10,24 cost 4:3 8:19 costing 4:7 costs 10:15 council 1:13 2:2,15 3:24 8:16 10:24 12:17 14:19 15:3 council's 4:8 councilmember 3:1 15:9,10 16:25 17:5,14 councilmemb... 2:2 3:17 10:18 couple 2:9 8:14 15:19 cover 5:7 create 4:15 created 3:9 creates 4:7 current 10:13 10:23 11:2,9 11:21 12:8 16:16</p>	<p>department 2:14,17,22 5:11 10:5 14:2 14:9 department's 2:15,16 departmental 2:7 departments 5:2 14:7,11,17 depth 5:9 difference 15:14 different 11:12 dipping 6:10 direction 3:12 directions 3:22 director 2:1,4 2:18,22,25 12:17 directors 2:14 disclosure 4:25 discussing 6:13 discussion 5:9 10:25 distribute 3:15 3:22 documents 4:15 dollar 7:25 dollars 7:18 13:23 16:10 door 7:20 double 15:14</p>	<p>dpu 8:20,20 driving 7:14</p> <hr/> <p>e</p> <p>e 18:2 earlier 15:13 earnings 4:25 economic 6:19 6:21 edged 15:15 either 9:10 elected 4:24 email 3:7,14,19 employee 4:24 enabling 4:15 encompassing 7:2 environment 10:13,16 equated 14:25 essence 8:7 established 13:4 estate 7:5 estimate 6:9 12:25 13:1,4 14:10 16:11,22 estimates 7:12 10:23,24 11:2 et 2:17 exactly 12:13 example 8:3,11 exclude 6:20 expenditures 5:11</p>	<p>explain 6:11</p> <hr/> <p>f</p> <p>f 18:2 facilities 7:12 facility 8:15,18 far 2:10 fast 10:11 fee 8:4 feel 16:22 fees 7:2 fencing 8:13 fierro 2:1,3,25 12:17 fifth 12:5 final 4:19 finally 4:18 first 2:2 15:11 15:11 fiscal 9:6,9 five 12:2,5 flow 5:4 folks 15:8 follow 4:12 followed 10:7 foregoing 18:5 formal 3:6 formally 4:23 format 2:11 forth 6:5 forward 9:11 13:15 franchise 7:2 fresno 1:13 fully 14:14</p>
<p>d</p>			
<p>dais 3:18 data 5:1 date 18:7 day 3:12,16,23 decline 6:12 declining 6:11 deficit 4:7</p>			

[fund - little]

<p>fund 2:6 4:7,11 5:4,7,11,14,17 12:4 15:4 funded 14:14 further 6:25 10:10 14:6 future 13:17 16:18,19 fy 2:4 5:13 7:7 7:10,18 9:11 10:24 13:22 14:2 16:23</p>	<p>greatly 3:7 grew 6:7 gross 16:17 grow 6:8 growing 6:6,22 7:11 10:11,11 12:23,23 15:21 growth 6:17 7:11,15 9:4 10:10,15 11:11 11:23 12:25 13:13 14:13 guidance 9:12 11:8 guys 15:17</p>	<p>history 13:19 hit 7:24 hopefully 3:15 12:11 housekeeping 4:22 hundred 8:14 hyde 18:4,13</p>	<p>items 2:9</p>
<p>g</p>	<p>h</p>	<p>i</p>	<p>j</p>
<p>general 2:5,8 4:7,11 5:4,6,11 5:14,16 12:4 14:19 15:1,3 generated 8:9 getting 3:20 12:7 give 5:24 given 9:6 gives 12:12 go 4:2 5:8,9 7:13 11:5,17 15:18 16:5,14 17:11 goal 3:11 7:6 goes 16:21 going 2:21 5:3 5:5,22 6:2 11:5 12:18,20 13:15 good 2:1 7:24 10:20,20 15:23</p>	<p>half 8:5,8 headed 7:7 hear 2:3 16:13 hearing 3:3 hearings 2:5 3:6,13 help 3:8 helpful 12:12 17:8 helps 17:15 henry 2:1,3,25 12:17 higher 11:19,20 highly 3:10 historical 5:24 9:2 12:20 14:10 historically 6:5 13:17 14:22</p>	<p>idea 12:12 illustration 5:13 impacts 10:14 incentives 6:19 6:21 include 14:14 incorporate 6:23 incorporated 3:14 incorporates 16:18 individual 6:13 inflationary 10:14 information 3:18 interest 8:9 intergovernm... 7:3 intragovernm... 7:4 item 4:21,22 17:11</p>	<p>july 13:2 june 3:25 4:16 4:18</p>
			<p>k</p>
			<p>karbassi 15:9 15:10 16:25 17:5,14 keep 6:18 10:16 kind 9:7,19 know 11:17 15:12 16:3 17:7</p>
			<p>l</p>
			<p>land 7:18 14:11 largest 5:16 latest 13:2 ledanski 18:4 18:13 left 7:20 license 6:4 likely 9:18,20 11:4 12:7 line 6:16 11:8 12:9 14:8 list 3:6,12 4:1 listings 4:24 little 5:8,24 7:20 9:14,23 10:22 11:13,19 12:12,14 13:19 15:13,25 16:22</p>

[long - portfolio]

<p>long 15:18 longer 10:25 look 5:10 6:8 6:16 7:6,9 12:22 losses 16:19 lot 17:15</p>	<p>million 5:15,18 5:21 7:18,22 7:25 8:3,5,5,8 8:22,24 11:20 13:23 14:4,25 16:10,17 mind 6:18 10:17 minor 8:11 moment 10:18 16:4 money 15:22 month 16:21 17:4 months 15:22 morning 2:1 10:20 motion 3:2,4,5 3:7,9,12 4:12 motions 3:22 3:24 4:1,3 mous 14:15 move 5:3,23 6:13 9:10 12:18 13:15 movement 13:11,12 moving 14:1 16:7 multiple 9:16 muni 9:16 16:11 muniservices 9:12 11:3,12 12:6</p>	<p>n</p> <p>n 18:2 natural 13:10 nearly 10:1 need 4:9 needed 4:13,19 negative 14:20 15:2 nervous 15:20 new 10:6 note 4:22 noted 11:1 november 18:7 number 12:6 14:20,21 16:1 16:23 numbers 16:9</p> <p>o</p> <p>o 18:2 observed 4:6 10:12 occupation 13:24 office 4:2 13:3 13:4 officials 4:24 oh 6:15 16:3,13 okay 2:3 5:12 15:18 16:14 17:14 once 5:9 6:22 ongoing 6:3 operations 2:17 optimistic 9:19 9:20 11:13</p>	<p>originally 11:3 overall 6:7 14:12 oversees 8:7 overview 1:14 2:6,9,14 5:4,5 15:4</p> <p>p</p> <p>pardon 12:8 parks 8:15,19 part 9:9 particular 11:16 past 11:15 payments 6:23 payouts 6:20 pays 8:19 peg 13:14 people 16:7 percent 5:18,22 6:7,9,11,17,22 8:23 10:2,4,6,7 10:8 11:23,24 11:25 12:25 13:5 14:13,24 perfect 2:3,25 personnel 5:2 pie 5:15 14:8 place 13:11 point 4:5 6:15 7:17 12:9 13:21 14:18 points 2:13 portfolio 8:4</p>
<p>m</p> <p>made 15:14 main 5:7 11:7 major 5:20 10:3 make 3:1,8,17 3:20 10:22 16:2 17:1,11 making 12:16 manager 10:19 16:12 17:3,10 mark 7:25 materials 10:7 maxwell 2:20 15:6 mayor 15:12 mean 8:22 measuring 13:16 meet 4:9 meetings 1:13 member 15:15 metering 8:18 8:19 midyear 11:1 mike 15:10 16:25 17:5,14</p>			

[possible - sales]

<p>possible 3:21 present 2:14 presentation 2:23 15:4,7 presentations 2:7 president 2:2 2:20 15:6 pretty 9:9 13:11,16 previous 3:6 primarily 9:3 primary 14:5 prior 4:6 6:1 10:12 probably 8:14 procedures 2:10 proceed 2:6 proceedings 18:6 program 13:22 projected 11:3 projecting 7:13 12:24 projection 10:9 10:18 11:18 12:3 16:16 projections 9:22 12:5,16 17:12 prop 7:5 properties 8:13 property 5:17 6:4 12:19</p>	<p>proposed 5:13 6:10 12:21 14:3 provide 3:13 9:24 10:22 provided 3:6 provides 8:20 9:16 providing 2:5 public 14:5 publish 3:11 published 13:2 pulling 11:2 purpose 14:19 15:2</p>	<p>real 2:12 7:5 realign 4:11 really 9:21 reason 11:7 14:21 15:1 receipts 11:6 receive 9:15 received 11:19 receiving 8:8 recent 13:24 recommend 11:23 recommended 11:24 recommending 11:14,20 reconciliation 4:10 record 18:6 recorded 3:4 reduced 6:10 reflect 10:9 regarding 10:23 regional 8:15 reimbursement 8:20 relation 13:20 relationship 13:8,19 relative 9:6 relatively 8:24 remind 10:24 removal 8:12</p>	<p>report 4:23 11:12 represents 13:6 request 3:17 reserved 4:19 reserves 15:23 restaurants 10:5 retail 10:4 revenue 5:6,19 5:22 6:3,14 7:1 7:15 8:21,23 13:9 15:20,24 revenues 5:10 5:14,17 14:1 review 2:5 reviews 2:11 right 15:11 room 6:5 7:6 7:16 13:7,20 13:22 roughly 5:21 running 14:23 ruthie 10:19,21 16:4,12 17:3 17:10</p>
	q		
	<p>quarterly 17:6 17:12 questions 2:16 2:19,24 15:5 15:19 queued 15:8 quickly 2:12 quinto 10:19 16:12 17:3,10 quite 16:5</p>		
	r		
	<p>r 18:2 raised 15:21 rate 14:22,24 rather 11:25 12:9 reading 16:6</p>		s
			<p>safety 14:5 sales 5:21 6:4 6:16,18,21 9:1 9:15,21,25 10:2,6,17,23 12:6,19 13:9 13:11,15,21 15:24,24</p>

<p>save 15:22 savings 15:1 saying 16:3 scenario 11:4 12:7 scenarios 9:17 scheduled 3:25 second 3:4 5:20 6:12 16:13 section 5:2 13:25 see 5:12,15 6:2 6:6,16 7:1,10 7:16 9:3,11 10:3 11:8 12:4 13:12 14:3,5 14:20 seeing 12:23 seeking 9:13 seems 13:16 segments 10:1 services 8:8 16:7 seven 8:3 several 11:15 share 2:13 5:10 17:6 show 9:2,5 13:8 13:18 showing 12:20 shows 14:9 15:2 signature 18:12 significant 12:2 12:10</p>	<p>similar 12:19 slide 5:12,23,23 6:25 9:1 12:18 13:6,18 slowing 10:10 small 8:25 15:21 smoothed 12:9 smoothing 12:2 solid 8:18 somewhat 8:25 9:18 sonya 18:4,13 soon 3:13 sorry 8:15 source 14:6 sources 5:22 6:3 specific 2:16 3:8 specifically 5:6 14:2 spending 10:14 sports 8:17 spot 7:24 staff 2:18 3:5 4:14 15:17 standing 17:11 start 2:8 5:5 6:13 starting 6:3 9:4 15:8 starts 6:1 statistics 9:25</p>	<p>stop 15:4 stores 10:5 subcommittee 4:8 submission 3:7 summary 12:4 sure 3:8,20 10:22 16:2 17:1,11 swing 11:15 12:2 sword 15:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">t</p> <hr/> <p>t 18:2,2 table 13:18 14:9 take 11:25 12:13 takes 13:11 16:13 talking 15:24 target 16:2 17:2 tax 5:17,21 6:4 6:4,5,16,18,21 7:5 9:1,15,21 9:25 10:2,17 10:23 12:6,19 12:19 13:7,7,9 13:11,15,20,20 13:21,22,24 15:24,24 taxed 16:8 technology 16:15</p>	<p>tell 15:15,25 thank 2:25 8:17 10:20,20 12:16 15:7,11,12,17 16:14 thankfully 15:23 thing 4:5 13:21 14:18 things 12:15 think 7:24 9:17 9:18 thought 11:16 thousand 8:14 thursday 4:16 4:18 time 3:3 7:20 9:11 11:7,14 11:21 15:8,18 tj 10:20 today 2:4 total 5:22 8:23 10:2 14:3 totaling 5:14 touched 16:4 towards 16:7 track 17:1 transcript 18:5 transfer 7:5 transit 13:24 transparency 4:23 treasury 8:6 trend 5:24 7:23 9:3 12:20</p>
--	---	--	---

[trends - years]

<p>trends 7:8 true 18:5 trying 8:16 9:14,21 10:16 two 7:12 13:8 13:13,14 tyler 2:20 15:6</p>	<p>13:21 14:18 15:12 16:1 wanted 7:16 9:2,5 10:21 13:7 waste 8:18 way 15:20 we've 8:10 11:18 website 5:1 wednesday 3:25 wide 11:14 wild 12:1,1 wishes 3:1 work 4:9 working 15:17 worksheet 4:10 worry 16:2 worth 8:5 writing 3:19</p>
u	y
<p>under 5:1 8:23 11:8 12:3 14:19 unit 8:6 units 14:17 use 14:5 used 12:14 16:15 using 7:23 utilizing 9:12 11:10</p>	<p>year 2:12 6:1 7:21 9:7,9 10:23 11:2,4,9 11:11,15,15,21 11:22 12:3,5,5 12:8,8,10,11,23 12:24 15:13 16:16 year's 11:18 years 4:6 10:12 11:16</p>
v	
<p>values 13:2 various 5:18 8:2 14:7 verbatim 12:14 verbiage 3:9,20 visual 12:22 14:4 vote 4:20 voted 3:25 4:1 4:16</p>	
w	
<p>walk 2:10 want 2:9 4:5 10:21 13:14,17</p>	

Exhibit FF

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Fresno City Council Meetings
2023.06.14 Budget Hearings

1 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: So with that
2 being said, I will hand it over to my colleagues,
3 starting with Councilmember Karbassi. Any
4 amendments, new motions, or registers of no
5 votes?

6 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Thank you
7 so much, Mr. President. I have a few. Ruthie
8 get your calculator out. So, sorry. I need one
9 moment. I'm going to start in reverse. I'm
10 going to register a no vote on Motion 84. And
11 then when it comes to the motions, on Motion 37 -
12 and I will, of course, email this over -- I would
13 like to change the language to read instead of
14 "allotted (indiscernible) the contested landscape
15 buffer," that is the proper technical term --

16 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: Do they need
17 a second when they amend it? Just to be clear.

18 CITY ATTORNEY ANDREW JANZ: Just for
19 the second to give a nod and thumbs up.

20 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: Okay. Can
21 you indicate who the second is on that
22 Councilmember.

23 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Yeah.
24 Let me find out. It was Motion 37, let me see
25 who the second was.

1 VICE PRESIDENT ANNALISA PEREA: \$50,000
2 for the installation of irrigation infrastructure
3 (indiscernible) --

4 COUNCILMEMBER MIQUEL ANGEL ARIAS:
5 Thank you, thank you Council Vice President.

6 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Yeah,
7 I'll say it over. It's just going to say,
8 instead of vacant lot, it's going to say the
9 Contessa Avenue landscape buffer. It will be
10 easier for Public Works.

11 Amend Motion Number 7, regarding
12 Project Spotlight. The second was Councilmember
13 Chavez -- well, actually, I was his second.
14 Excuse me. If you're okay with it, I just want
15 to amend to add Project Spotlight or any other
16 technology equipment service to combat organized
17 retail crime in Fresno. Thank you,
18 Councilmember.

19 A motion, a new motion to allocate
20 \$244,000 into the Shift replacement budget in the
21 Fresno Fire Department to aid in achieving a
22 minimum daily staffing level of 103.

23 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: You got a
24 second from Council Vice President Perea.

25 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Thank

1 you, Council Vice President. Amend Direction 24.
2 This was regarding meeting with the Budget
3 Subcommittee on revenues for property tax. I'd
4 like it to actually read "any revenue." Just
5 have quarterly revenue reports for the Budget
6 Subcommittee.

7 CITY MANAGER GEORGEANNA WHITE: Number?

8 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: This was
9 Direction 24.

10 CITY MANAGER GEORGEANNA WHITE: Oh,
11 direction. Where's direction?

12 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: Can you state
13 that one more time, please.

14 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: So
15 earlier I made a -- so last week, a made a
16 Council Direction 24, which was about quarterly
17 reports and property tax revenues. I'd like it
18 to include all revenues. So just basically
19 revenue reports quarterly to the Council Budget
20 Subcommittee, please.

21 PRESIDENT TYLER MAXWELL: Thank you.

22 COUNCILMEMBER MIKE KARBASSI: Okay.

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.

Date: November 16, 2023

<%12151,Signature%>
Sonya Ledanski Hyde

[103 - meeting]

1	angel 3:4	d	i
103 3:22	annalisa 3:1	daily 3:22	include 4:18
12151 5:11	arias 3:4	date 5:6	indicate 2:21
16 5:6	attorney 2:18	department	indiscernible
2	avenue 3:9	3:21	2:14 3:3
2023 5:6	b	direction 4:1,9	infrastructure
2023.06.14 1:14	basically 4:18	4:11,11,16	3:2
24 4:1,9,16	budget 1:14	e	installation 3:2
244,000 3:20	3:20 4:2,5,19	e 5:1	irrigation 3:2
3	buffer 2:15 3:9	earlier 4:15	it's 3:7
37 2:11,24	c	easier 3:10	i'd 4:17
5	c 5:1,1	email 2:12	i'll 3:7
50,000 3:1	calculator 2:8	equipment	j
7	certify 5:3	3:16	janz 2:18
7 3:11	change 2:13	excuse 3:14	k
8	chavez 3:13	f	karbassi 2:3,6
84 2:10	city 1:13 2:18	f 5:1	2:23 3:6,25 4:8
a	4:7,10	find 2:24	4:14,22
accurate 5:4	clear 2:17	fire 3:21	l
achieving 3:21	colleagues 2:2	foregoing 5:4	landscape 2:14
actually 3:13	combat 3:16	fresno 1:13	3:9
4:4	comes 2:11	3:17,21	language 2:13
add 3:15	contessa 3:9	g	ledanski 5:3,12
aid 3:21	contested 2:14	georgeanna 4:7	level 3:22
allocate 3:19	council 1:13	4:10	lot 3:8
allotted 2:14	3:5,24 4:1,16	give 2:19	m
amend 2:17	4:19	going 2:9,10	made 4:15,15
3:11,15 4:1	councilmember	3:7,8	manager 4:7,10
amendments	2:3,6,22,23 3:4	h	maxwell 2:1,16
2:4	3:6,12,18,25	hand 2:2	2:20 3:23 4:12
andrew 2:18	4:8,14,22	hearings 1:14	4:21
	course 2:12	hyde 5:3,12	meeting 4:2
	crime 3:17		

[meetings - yeah]

<p>meetings 1:13 mike 2:6,23 3:6 3:25 4:8,14,22 minimum 3:22 miquel 3:4 moment 2:9 motion 2:10,11 2:24 3:11,19 3:19 motions 2:4,11</p>	<p>project 3:12,15 proper 2:15 property 4:3,17 public 3:10</p>	<p>signature 5:11 sonya 5:3,12 sorry 2:8 spotlight 3:12 3:15 staffing 3:22 start 2:9 starting 2:3 state 4:12 subcommittee 4:3,6,20</p>	<p>w</p>
<p>n</p>	<p>q</p>	<p>t</p>	<p>want 3:14 week 4:15 white 4:7,10 works 3:10</p>
<p>n 5:1 need 2:8,16 new 2:4 3:19 nod 2:19 november 5:6 number 3:11 4:7</p>	<p>quarterly 4:5 4:16,19</p>	<p>t 5:1,1 tax 4:3,17 technical 2:15 technology 3:16 term 2:15 thank 2:6 3:5,5 3:17,25 4:21 thumbs 2:19 time 4:13 transcript 5:4 true 5:4 tyler 2:1,16,20 3:23 4:12,21</p>	<p>y</p>
<p>o</p>	<p>r</p>	<p>v</p>	<p>yeah 2:23 3:6</p>
<p>o 5:1 oh 4:10 okay 2:20 3:14 4:22 organized 3:16</p>	<p>r 5:1 read 2:13 4:4 record 5:5 regarding 3:11 4:2 register 2:10 registers 2:4 replacement 3:20 reports 4:5,17 4:19 retail 3:17 revenue 4:4,5 4:19 revenues 4:3,17 4:18 reverse 2:9 ruthie 2:7</p>	<p>vacant 3:8 vice 3:1,5,24 4:1 vote 2:10 votes 2:5</p>	
<p>p</p>	<p>s</p>		
<p>perea 3:1,24 please 4:13,20 president 2:1,7 2:16,20 3:1,5 3:23,24 4:1,12 4:21 proceedings 5:5</p>	<p>second 2:17,19 2:21,25 3:12 3:13,24 see 2:24 service 3:16 shift 3:20</p>		